THE FORMULATION DESIGN OF REGIONAL REGULATIONS POLICY IN THE REGIONAL HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES: STUDY ON HANDLING VAGABONDS AND BEGGARS IN PALU CITY

(PERENCANAAN REKABENTUK KEBIJAKAN REGULASI DI DEWAN PERWAKILAN RAKYAT: KAJIAN PENANGANAN GELANDANGAN DAN PENGEMIS DI KOTA PALU)

Moh. Irfan Mufti, Intam Kurnia, H. Nanang,Sharifah Zarina Syed Zakaria & Muhammad Rizal Razman

Abstract

Vagabonds and beggars become one of the social problems that are not easy to solve. The reality of vagabonds and beggars has taken root in developing countries, especially in Indonesia which its existence is inevitable in people's lives, especially those who live in urban areas. This study aims to provide an overview process of Formulation of Regional Regulation Policy on Handling Vagabonds and Beggars in the Regional House of Representatives (DPRD) of Palu City. This study uses a qualitative approach with descriptive methods. The research was conducted at the Regional House of Representatives of Palu City. The results of the study showed that the formulation of regional regulation policy on Handling Vagabonds and Beggars began with several stages. The first stage of problem identification, the tendency of this stage is that there is still discoordination between agencies that have the authority to handle vagabonds and beggars in Palu City which results in the drafting of long-standing regional regulations. The fact that the reality of Palu local government requires a legal foundation and regulation for handling vagabonds and beggars which is more procedural and proportional. The second stage will be the agenda-setting, which focuses on the legal basis of formation. The agenda-setting in the formulation process is still running as it is. The third stage of alternative selection, through discussions at the Regional Regulatory Agency (Bapemperda) of the DPRD in Palu, is currently still being discussed by the special committee. In the special committee process, comparative studies were also conducted in several other regions which have successfully handled vagabonds and beggars, as well as public hearings with stakeholders to get input or suggestion. The fourth stage is policy setting, which includes the facilitation of the Governor through the Central Bureau of Law of the Central Sulawesi Province, followed by a plenary session in order to approve the enactment of the DPRD, and then the registration by the Governor and the City Regional Secretariat to be submitted to the Social and Manpower Office for the socialization and implementation.

Keywords: Formulation, problem identification, agenda setting, alternative selection, policy setting, vagabonds, and beggars
**Abstrak**


**Kata kunci:** Perumusan, identifikasi masalah, penetapan agenda, pemilihan alternatif, penetapan kebijakan, gelandangan, dan pengemis

**INTRODUCTION**

The fourth paragraph of the Preamble of the Republic of Indonesia 1945 constitution states that the objective of the establishment of the Republic of Indonesia is "to protect the entire Indonesian nation and all of Indonesia's bloodshed and to advance public welfare, educate the nation's life, and participate in carrying out world order based on independence, eternal peace and social justice." Furthermore, in order to promote public welfare, in the body of the 1945 Constitution Article 34 stated that: (1) the poor and neglected children are maintained by the state. (2) The state develops a social security system for all people and empowers people who are weak and incapable in accordance with human dignity. (3) The state is responsible in providing appropriate health and public service facilities (Marshall 1971).

The material content above shows that it is the state’s obligation to take care of the poor and neglected children, the government is also obliged to provide facilities in a social security system and empower people who are weak and unable to comply with dignity and humanity. The indigent poor and neglected children in Indonesia, generally in urban areas are reflected in the increasing number of vagabonds and beggars. The conditions of poverty and life demands make them as "Vagabonds and Beggars". Ironically the vagabonds and beggars increases every year, it even becomes a business that is used by certain people and exploits them as illegal businesses by irresponsible parties. This situation is a slap for the government which has been campaigning for reducing poverty and improving the welfare of the poor. The presence and sensitivity of the government becomes an absolute, not only as mere political jargon (Winamo 2008 & 2012).
It is inversely proportional to the mandate of the 1945 Constitution, the reality of information in various media that the control of vagabonds, beggars and street children are not based on human values, they were forced to even be hurt when arrested and led by officers to the control car, then taken to social rehabilitation sites for data and after that it is released again and again decorates the streets, red lights intersections, and other crowded places. Vagabonds and beggars are those whom socially disadvantaged, as a result of the government not carrying out the mandate of the 1945 Constitution seriously, there are many vagabonds, beggars and street children who became as the victims of crime. Handling vagabonds and beggars besides being mandated by the Basic Law is also in harmony with the concept of the world community called the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). The MDGs are an international world agreement to achieve eight goals that are planned to support the efforts of countries in various parts of the world in achieving sustainable development. The agreement is the result of the Earth Summit in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil, with 21 main agendas that focus on eliminating poverty, increasing the role of women in the development and conservation of the environment (Winamo 2008 & 2012).

The concept of the MDGs comes with the thought that there are several things that make the community remain vulnerable and unable to fulfill their basic needs, so that eight goals and target indicators are set which are expected to be able to help them get out of very basic problems in backwardness that is. The MDGs carry three central themes, namely human development, human security and human rights. The concept of the MDGs is actually just one attempt to equalize the global vision which is then translated into local actions of development. This concept basically aims to bring development towards a more equitable for all parties, namely for humans and the environment as well as for present and future generations (Winamo 2008 & 2012).

Therefore, as a form of responsibility of the Regional Government of Palu City in handling homelessness and beggars in the City of Palu, the local government then proposes the Draft Regional Regulation contained in the 2017 Regional Legislation Program to be discussed by the stipulation of Regional Regulations by the Regional People’s Legislative Assembly (DPRD) Palu in the fourth quarter IV (Four). The stipulation of DPRD is one of the functions of the DPRD, namely the Establishment of Regional Regulations, as Article 18 paragraph 5 states that "Regional governments have the right to set regional regulations and regulations to carry out autonomy and co-administration." The role of the DPRD, as stated in Law Number 23 Year 2014 in the General Explanation of the second part concerning the administration of regional governments, that:"... DPRD and regional heads are located as elements of the regional government administrators who are given the people's mandate to carry out Government Affairs which is delegated to the Regions. Thus the DPRD and regional heads are located as equal partners who have different functions. The DPRD has the function of establishing regional regulations, budgets and supervision, while the regional heads carry out the implementation function of regional regulations and regional policies. In regulating and managing Government Affairs which are the authority of the Region, the DPRD and regional heads are assisted by the Regional Apparatus."

This shows, that the House of Representatives, has 3 (three) functions, which are 1) Establishment of Regional regulations, 2) Budget, 3) Supervision. If the budget function of the DPRD refers to power in discussing and giving approval or not giving approval to the draft Regional Regulation on APBD submitted by the Mayor, the function of supervision is the function carried out through supervision of the implementation of Regional Regulations and the Regional Budget Planning (APBD), then the function of legislation as the first function of the DPRD institution is as a manifestation of the DPR as the holder of the power to form a law. The function of the formation of regional regulations is the main vehicle for DPRDs to reflect the aspirations and interests of the people in the formulation of Regional Regulations which is a concrete manifestation of the implementation of the legislative function by the DPRD. Establishment of regional regulations as material for legal management at the regional level in order to realize the needs of legislation to implement regional government as well as a place to accommodate the aspirations that develops in the community.
Based on the three functions possessed by the DPRD, the relationship between the regional government and the DPRD is a working relationship that is partnership and equal, the partnership relationship means that between the Regional Government and the DPRD are partners in making regional policies to implement regional autonomy in accordance with their respective functions, so that between the two institutions establish a working relationship that is mutually supportive while an equal position means that among the regional government institutions have an equal position, meaning that they are not superficial and the DPRD as a representative body, also placed itself as the balancing power (balanced power) that balances and controls the Regional Head and all levels of regional government. This relationship can be reflected in making regional policies in the form of Regional Regulations (Nugroho 2008; Isra 2010).

Regarding the capacity of the DPRD as policy maker, it is not as a policy implementer in the regions, especially in the formation of Regional Regulations whose authority is as large as that of the Regional Government which is even more prioritized by the law. The establishment of Regional Regulations as a policy-making process as political activity, according to Dunn (2013) it is visualized as a series of interdependent stages arranged in a timeline: agenda setting, policy formulation, policy adoption, policy implementation, and policy assessment (Dunn 2013). This shows that the formulation process is the formulation of public policy in the second stage of the cycle stated above, this also shows that policy formulation is an important stage in policy formation, because it contains the forecasting policies that will be implemented, so that in the process of forecasting implementation set according to reality assumptions, the policy will produce optimal policy performance (Parsons 2005).

Dunn (2013) further argued that forecasting is very important in the process of policy formulation because: “Forecasting provides relevant knowledge and policies about problems that will occur in the future as a result of taking alternatives, including not doing something; this is done in the stage of policy formulation. Forecasting can test a plausible, potential, and normatively valuable future, estimating the consequences of existing or proposed policies recognizing possible constraints in achieving goals, and estimating political feasibility (support and opposition) from various selection” (Dunn 2013).

The results of the observations indicate that the implementation of the function of forming regional regulations by the DPRD of Palu City has not been able to run optimally, with indications of the emergence of Regional Regulations that are not properly formulated. The number of problematic local regulations that are identified as legal products that have formal defects and experience implementation problems. This reality is the background of the author to analyze the Formulation of the Draft Regional Regulation Policy on Handling Vagabonds and Beggars by choosing locus in the Regional Representative Council of the City of Palu. As with the background above and to limit the focus of the research, the problems formulated will be the object of research in the form of questions, which is: How is the Formulation of the Policy Draft Regional Regulations on Handling Vagabonds and Beggars in the Regional Representative Council of Palu City?

**RESEARCH METHODS**

Formulation of the Regional Regulation Draft Policy on Handling Vagabonds and Beggars in the Regional Representative Council of Palu, presented with the method of "qualitative descriptive" which are describing and explaining social phenomena about the policy formulation process by presenting data accompanied by giving meaning behind the visible data. The data collection techniques derived from primary data and secondary data, and collected through observation, interviews, and documentation. According to Sugiyono (2015) in the analysis of qualitative data there are three lines of activities carried out simultaneously after data collection as follow as:

1. Data Condensation, refers to the process of selecting, simplifying, abstracting, and/or transforming data,
2. Presentation of data, as the results of organizing, unification of information that allows inference and action.
3. Conclusion withdrawals and verification. Starting from noting the regularity of explanations, possible configurations, paths of cause and effect, and propositions.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Based on the concept definition that has been stated in the literature review, the researchers formulate operational definitions in the form of indicators of variables that are used as references in describing the discussion of policy formulations as part of the pre-decision-making policy phase which includes identification and/or preparation of alternative sets of policies to overcome problems, and narrowing down the collection of solutions to be prepared in the final policy decision covering 4 stages, with the following discussion:

Formulation of the Problem of Vagabonds and Beggars in Palu City

As the draft Regional Regulation for Handling Vagabonds and Beggars is a draft policy that designed in an effort to overcome the problems of vagabonds and beggars in Palu City, as for the urgency of the regulation requirements of the Regional Regulations of Palu which regulates specifically vagabonds and beggars, based on the results of identification and observation of the field can be classified as:

Disorders of peace and order

Peace and order problems arise when vagabonds and beggars have dominated public places such as markets, terminals, protocol roads, shops, places to eat and other public places so as to disturb the comfort of other user communities.

Exploitation of infants and children, children with disabilities (blind)

In addition to the disturbance of sprained security and order also exploits infants and children, children to attract mercy from others, another method is to use disable people (blind). Children and infants are the next generation of the nation, therefore the growth and development of children needs to be given more attention, especially in terms of education. A growing phenomenon is using infants or toddlers that their very small age turns out as a big chance to be exposed like they have diseases. Begging and busking activities carried out by children and adolescents are indicated in the form of organized communities. The observations of researchers directly in the field that there are among street children and vagabonds and beggars who roam in the Palu City which are deliberately coordinated by certain parties, such as for example street children in traffic lights, they are a group unit sheltered by certain people.

Beggars become professions

The amount of acceptance is what drives beggars more and more in the city of Palu, and it has been identified as a profession. It is proven that the discipline of vagabonds and beggars is an old player who, when repatriated, has a decent life in his native area, seen from the houses they have.

Problems with territorial administration

This reality had an effect on the field of financing administration and also population in the government of Palu City, because the authority for guidance was only for residents of Palu City both administratively and in reality it resided and originated from Palu City.
Problems with Facility administration

The statement is in line with the reality that up to the time of the study, the government of Palu City did not yet have a social institution so that it was deposited at the Bina Remaja Social Institution in Central Sulawesi Province, but this institution also had limitations.

Legal Foundation Issues

The statement shows that the absence of regional regulations governing vagabonds and beggars administratively can be interpreted as not having accepted the authority of vagabonds and beggars. Therefore, local regulations in governing the vagabonds and beggars are needed, so that the funds and buildings can be allocated for guidance. The results of the identification indicate vagabonds and beggars’ activities in the area of Palu City were encountered in: (a) traffic light crossroads at Juanda Street - Sisimangaraja Street - Veteran Street - Moh. Yamin Street; (b) traffic light crossroads at Basuki Rahmat Street - Emi Saelan Street - I Gusti Ngurah Ray Street; (c) traffic light crossroads at Samratulangi Street; (d) the crossroads of Gatot Subroto and Juanda Street; (e) Inpres Market Area; (f) around the hotel of Santika; (g) front yard of Bumi Nyiur Swalayan Market; (h) around the shopping complex; and (i) around Imam Bonjol street. All stakeholders should have a very important role in accordance with their duties in carrying out vagabonds and beggars control. Therefore, each party is expected to be able to create a good interaction system cooperation.

Palu City Vagabonds and Beggar Policy Agenda

The Policy Agenda in implementing the formation of regional regulations can be classified into three steps, as follows: (a) Identify legal baselines or legal grounds, and how new regional regulations (PERDA) can solve problems. (b) Preparation of Academic Scripts. (c) Writing the draft of PERDA. The three stages of the agenda setting process can be done in phases despite the reality and field observations that the Academic Text and Writing of the Draft Regional Regulations have been received by the government of Palu City, so that this discussion will focus on the process of identifying legal baselines or legal grounds.

Alternative Choices

Alternative selection can be elaborated through the implementation of Public Consultation, Revision of the Regional Regulation’s draft that exists and if needed additional public consultation can be carried out in the form of a discussion process in the DPRD of Palu City, which is described in the following activities:

Discussion at the Regional Office

From the results of the observations during the discussion there are several things that can be categorized including: (1) Assessment of Regional Regulation Readiness (systematics), in this case DPRD members questioned the systematic draft of the Vagabonds and Beggar Regional Regulation in accordance with Law Number 12 of 2018. (2) Strength of Discussion on Legal Basis, namely Laws, Government Regulations and Decrees of Social Ministers regarding Homelessness and Beggars. (3) Readiness of Academic Manuscripts as Supporting documents, DPRD Members highlight the Academic Manuscripts that were submitted because they used old and up-to-date data, for which the service was given the opportunity until discussion on February 2 2019, to make improvements to data and Academic Manuscripts. (4) Digging the Urgency of the Regional Regulation Draft on developments carried out by members of the Palu City DPRD on the urgency of establishing a Regional Regulation. All of DPRD Members as a whole agreed that the Regional Regulation of vagabonds and beggars was included in the Regional Regulation Program (Propemperda) in quarter I of year 2018.
Plenary Meeting

Plenary Meeting on the Establishment of a Regional Regulation for quarter I of 2018 held on February 5, 2018, the Regional Government of Palu City in this case represented by Assistant 1 in the field of Governance and Welfare. Provide an introductory note to the 6 (six) Regional Regulations that will be submitted for discussion by the Special Committee (Pansus) of the Palu City DPRD. In the Plenary Meeting, 2 (two) Pans were formed, the names of the chairpersons and members of each Pansus, where each discussed 3 (three) Draft Regional Regulations in Palu City. In the plenary meeting, each of 9 (nine) factions in the Palu City DPRD stated their agreement regarding to the Establishment of the Palu City Regional Regulation.

Discussion of the Special Committee II

Discussion of the Vagabonds and Beggars Draft Regional Regulation was carried out for 1 (one) month by Special Committee II, which was from February 8, to March 9, 2018, as shown in the following description: During the discussion by the Special Committee II in the DPRD of Palu City, in addition to the discussions carried out also discussed activities which include:

Comparative Study

Comparative Study was conducted by the Special Committee II of DPRD to the City of Surabaya with the following considerations: (1) the city of Surabaya is a city that is successful in overcoming the problem of vagabonds and beggars. (2) Facilities and infrastructure for handling vagabonds and beggars have been adequate.

Forum Group Discussion

In addition to comparative studies also carried out Forum Group Discussion during the discussion of Vagabonds and Beggars in Palu City, this meeting was held on Thursday, March 8 by presenting:

1. Social Service of the Palu City Manpower.
2. Civil Service Police Unit of Palu City
3. NGOs with social problems observation
4. Academics

The list shows that based on the results of the Special Committee there are 8 (eight) corrections which include:

1. Procedure word omission.
2. Experiencing Changes, enchanting others to stimulate the mercy of others to be a forcing fellow to get mercy from others.
3. Experiencing Change in Title of Provisioning and Procedure for Handling Vagabonds and Beggars into Handling Vagabonds and Beggars.
4. Sixth Section Experiencing Changes in Procedures for Handling Homeless and Beggars into Handling Homeless and Beggars.
5. Article 15 experiences Amendments (1) Procedures for handling Vagabonds and Beggars are carried out according to standards, Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) (1) Guidance and supervision of vagabonds and beggars carried out by Regional Heads, (2) Further provisions regarding Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) as referred to in paragraph (1) governed by the Regulations of the Mayor (2) the regional head in conducting guidance and supervision as referred to in paragraph (1) may delegate to appointed officials based on the tasks of the Regional Device Organization.
6. Seventh Part (Additional) Article 16 concerning Evaluation and Reporting includes (1) Evaluation and reporting of handling homeless and beggars carried out by Regional Device Organizations that handle homeless and beggar planning affairs (2) Based on the results of evaluation and reporting as referred to in paragraph (1) there is a violation, then sanctions will
be imposed (3) The application of sanctions and violations as referred to in paragraph (2) shall be carried out by agencies that have the task of upholding Regional Regulations, public order, and public tranquility through agencies dealing with social affairs and/or authorized officials in accordance with the Laws and Regulations.

7. Eighth Part Additional Article, which are Article 17 (Additional) (1) Handling of homeless and beggars is carried out by Regional Device Organizations which handle vagabonds and beggars planning matters (2) Handling of vagabonds and beggars in coordinative way by Regional Device Organizations handling Manpower affairs, health, education, social, environment and infrastructure (3) Further provisions regarding handling vagabonds and beggars as referred to in paragraph (1) are regulated by Mayor Regulation.

8. Chapter VII Closing Provisions in Article 23 (Changes in Sentence Editor) The Mayor's Regulation on Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) as referred to in article 15, is stipulated no later than 6 (six) months after this regional regulation is promulgated by the Mayor's Regulation on handling vagrant and beggars as referred to in article 17 are stipulated no later than 6 (six) months after this regional regulation is promulgated.

The results of the observations indicate that the change in substance was reflected in the results of a comparative study in Surabaya and input from the results of the Public Hearings conducted by the Special Committee II of the Palu City.

The Facilitation of the Governor (Central Sulawesi Regional Secretariat Law Bureau)

Facilitation is carried out through the Legal Bureau of the Central Sulawesi Provincial Secretariat on Friday, March 30, 2018, in the facilitation of the Legal Bureau in addition to presenting from the Palu City Government also presenting the Regional Equipment of Central Sulawesi Province, as can be seen in the following description: Adjusting to the manuscript arrangement stipulated in the Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 80 of 2015 concerning the Establishment of Regional Legal Products.

1. Addition to the enactment of the Regional Apparatus is a supporting element of the Mayor and the House of Representatives in the administration of Government Affairs which are the regional authority.
2. The writing of an acronym hereinafter abbreviated as RPS.
3. The mention of Regional Organizations changes into Regional Devices.
4. The mention of the Madani Regional General Hospital.
5. The mention of the Regional Head becomes the Mayor.
6. The organization becomes a regional apparatus in the social field;
7. Removal of LKS acronyms;
8. Criminal penalties for a maximum of 3 (three) months or a fine of at most IDR 3,000,000 (three millions of Indonesian Rupiahs)
9. Writing.

From the 9 (nine) corrections above, it can be seen that the facilitation by the governor does not involve the content of the Draft Regional Regulation, but rather refers to the systematic writing and content of the provisions of a regional regulation. The results of the repairs are expected to be received no later than Monday 2 April 2018. The approval of the substance of the content of the regional regulations of vagabonds and beggars by the Governor is given on Friday, 6 April 2018. Later returned to the Mayor of Palu, for approval by the DPRD.

Determination of Policy

The determination of policy by Assembly at Provincial of Palu and the ratification of regional regulations, is carried out through the signing of the Head of DPRD of Palu City, through a plenary session which is a Plenary Meeting for the Submission of the Governor's Facilitation Results, as shown in the following discussion: Numbering and signing by the Regional Secretary of Palu City has conducted on Tuesday July 3, 2018 to become a Regional Regulation on vagabonds and Beggars of
the Palu City, to be subsequently returned to the Office of Social Affairs and Manpower for Socialization and Implementation.

**Typical Model of Public Policy Formulation in the Process of Formulation of Regional Regulations (Perda) Number 3 of 2018 about Handling of Vagabonds and Beggars**

The formulation model that is typical of the local regulation formulation process is a Mixed Model consisting of the Elite Model and Institutional Model. In the elite model, it is seen that groups with power (elite groups) are very influential in the process of formulating public policies and will show whether these policies ultimately constitute community needs that must be accommodated or only preferences from elite groups. In this case, the elite group is the Government of Palu City, which in this case is represented by the Palu City Manpower Office, which has a very large influence in the process of formulating Regional Regulations (Perda) Number 3 of 2018 on Handling Vagabonds and Beggars. The desire to form Regional Regulation is based on consideration of disturbances in security and order, exploitation of children and infants and disables people, endangering personal safety and road users, beggars become profitable professions, territorial administration problems and facilities administration problems. Next, in the Institutional Model, it will be seen how the government has a very important role in the process of policy formulation and in this model the roles and functions of government institutions are very visible in making public policy. If you look at the process of formulating regional regulations (Perda) No. 3 of 2018 for handling vagabonds and beggars, it can be seen that there are several institutions that play a role, specifically the Social and Manpower Office of Palu City as the executive, Palu City Regional Representative Council (DPRD), and Regional Secretariat in this case by the Legal Section of the Regional Secretariat of Palu City. These three government institutions have their own respective roles.

**CONCLUSION**

From the result of the discussion, it can be concluded that the formulation of the regulation on the handling of vagabonds began with the first stage of identifying problems, which illustrated the urgency of handling vagabonds because it had caused disturbances in security and order, exploited children, infants and disabled people, in jeopardizing personal safety and road users, being a profession, and territorial problem. Obviously, it is realized that the government of the Palu City does not yet have coaching facilities. Therefore, it requires a legal basis for a systematic and proportional allocation of budgetary management. The second stage is an agenda setting that focuses on the legal basis of formation. The second stage is an agenda setting that focuses on the legal basis of formation. The discussion at the Regional Office, the Plenary Meeting, the Discussion of the Special Committee, in the special committee process were also conducted a comparative study to Surabaya which had managed to deal with the vagabonds and beggars, and public hearings with stakeholders to get input. The fourth stage is the determination phase includes the Facilitation of the Governor, in this case the Central Bureau of Regional Secretariat of the Central Sulawesi Province, followed by a plenary session in order to approve the enactment by the DPRD, and then the registration by the Governor and Enactment by the City Regional Secretariat. Socialization and Implementation, that in the formulation of Regional Regulation Number 3 Year 2018, the process in formulating the Regional Regulation is a Typical Mixed Model of Public Policy Formulation Model which consisting the Elite Model and Institutional Model. From the results of the discussion stated above, the suggestions are proposed in the form of: (1) In the process it appears that identification of the problem has not become the basis of the drafting of regional regulations and academic texts, so that it still raises various corrections and involves stakeholders as a whole including experts from public policy. (2) In the comparative study process, it should also involve observers from the vagabonds and beggars, because the model of success applied in Surabaya is uncertain to be applied in Palu City.

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENT**

Part of this study was conducted by using funding from the research project code XX-2017-006.
REFERENCES


Moh. Irfan Mufti
Faculty of Social and Political Sciences
Tadulako University
Palu, Indonesia
Email: irfanmufti66@gmail.com

Intam Kurnia
Faculty of Social and Political Sciences
Tadulako University
Palu, Indonesia
Email: kintam.68@gmail.com

H. Nanang
Faculty of Social and Political Sciences
Tadulako University
Palu, Indonesia
Email: nanang@gmail.com

Sharifah Zarina Syed Zakaria (Ph.D)
Asse. Prof.
Research Centre for Environment, Economic and Social Sustainability (KASES)
Institute for Environment & Development (LESTARI)
Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia
UKM Bangi, Selangor, Malaysia
Email: szarina@ukm.edu.my (Corresponding Author)

Muhammad Rizal Razman (Ph.D)
Professor
Research Centre for Sustainability Science & Governance (SGK)
Institute for Environment & Development (LESTARI)
Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia
UKM Bangi, Selangor, Malaysia
Email: mrizal@ukm.edu.my

Received : 20 February 2020
Accepted : 21 June 2020
Published : 30 June 2020