THE MARGINALIZATION OF STREET VENDORS (PKL) AMIDST THE REALIZATION OF MODERN MARKET DEVELOPMENT

(PEMINGGIRAN JALANAN PEDAGANG (PKL) DI TENGAH-TENGAH PENCAPAIAN PEMBANGUNAN PASARAN MODEN)

Mahpuddin, Ilyas Lampe, Sumarni Zainuddin, Muchri Ramah & Israwaty Suryadi

Abstract

Traditional Markets (PasarTradisional, abbreviated as Patra) of Manonda has a long history of the social, economic and political struggles of the people of Palu and its surroundings. Even issues such as inter-ethnic security and conflicts in the past are often associated with social and economic events. Recently, the issue of street vendors (Pedagang Kaki Lima, abbreviated as PKL) relocation surfaced again in public spaces as the theme of the conversation which until now has not reached the completion thoroughly. The problem is difficult to be separated from the government policy that has changed the status of the traditional market of Manonda into a central market and eventually turned into modernized traditional market (Patra-Modern). As a result, these policies triggered the birth of horizontal social violence as well as structural violence. From the entire occurrence formed, in the end the merchants become the marginalization victim. This study applies Critical perspective to reveal comprehensively the factors that become the basis of the problem of violence within the Manonda market, especially related to the merchant relocation policy. This perspective is based on the basic assumption that, in reality, violence within the market is a product of a power struggle between concerned parties such as; traders (PKL), private sectors and Palu city government. To answer the aforementioned problems, the authors and research subjects conduct intersubjective dialogue (especially to street vendors) to explore various aspects that trigger violence within the Manonda market. Through the operational stages of Donald E. Comctok's version of Critical method, various interrelated conditions can be clearly, comprehensively and critically explained. The results show that the violence behind the street vendors' relocation policy is a continuation of the city government's misperception. The error is based on the reducted meaning of the society development which tends to be limited to economic issues and ignores other aspects such as the realization of a sense of social justice. By utilizing the theoretical analysis tools of Critical School thinkers, this study offers a formulative solution to find a fair consensus and mainstreaming the discursive and deliberative problem-solving.

Keywords: Street Vendors Marginalization, Violence, Relocation Policy
Abstrak


Kata kunci: Pembasmiian Peninggiran Jalan Dagangan, Keganasan, Dasar Penempatan Semula

Introduction

Market infrastructure as one of the strategic public service facilities to be developed in order to push the development of the trade sector of economy. Through market modernization policy, local government also actively invite private party (in this case is PT Sari DewiMembangun) to invest with the principle of mutual benefit. Although, investment policy is not really consider the social and economic justice aspects of the community as an integral part in realizing the cooperation contract. Agreements are made with the investor without being based on an accurate and integrity impact assessment of environmental impact (Analisa Dampak Lingkungan, abbreviated as AMDAL). As a result, there is often a social upheaval that continues to haunt the realization of development projects. Similarly, the Manondamodern market development process is full of various acts of violence involving street vendors and local government officials.

Since the commencement of modern market development in 2010, until it’s completion in 2015, there have been violent acts of sociological and structural aspects. Violence occurred between traders and violence between traders and Satpol PP, supported by police and military officers (TNI). Social prejudice, conflict between Bugis and Kaili merchant groups, to casualties inflicted during a physical clash between Satpol PP officers (Brown, 2005). Those are the series of violence that accompanies the merchant relocation policy.

In February 2016, there is the mayor transition of Palu City, from the old officials to the new officials. The transition generated a glimmer of hope and optimism among merchants that the new mayor’s officials will pay attention to their fate and treat them more humanly. The attitude of...
merchants is relatively softened by opening up to conduct a dialogue with the city government. The government's appeal of the demand for relocation into the market is not impossible to realize as far as open and fair dialogue is concerned to find the best solution that can be accepted by both parties.

After the new effective mayor's leadership, the discourse on relocation policy is re-emerged. On July 30th 2016, on behalf of the mayor's instruction, the Palu City Government mobilized 200 personnel of Satpol PP who were tasked to carry out forced relocation of the street vendor's stalls along the road circling the Manonda market. After the last few months, traders who were originally implied to receive or succumb to the policy, now show a defensive attitude. The condition of the road that was previously smooth and free from the trading activity slowly began to be crowded by traders. The return of street traders is increasingly visible around the market.

This study focuses on the processes undertaken by the Palu City Government before the relocation policy is issued. The main pressure lies in the mechanism of dialogue conducted by Palu City Government. To provide a clear focus or research direction, the following main research problems are presented below:

1. What is the form of violence behind the merchant relocation policy in Manonda Palu Market in the past up until now.
3. How to encourage a comprehensive and equitable solution to every policy on merchant relocation.

THEORETICAL REVIEW

The Hegemony Theory

The hegemonic theory of Antonio Gramsci, extending the horizon and scope of thought about power relations between the forces in society. It is not only limited to economic dominance, but emphasizes the importance of the idea of exercising the power of control by certain social classes against other social classes (Shiraev & Levy 2012). According to Gramsci, the controlled party can obey the authorities, not only when the controlled party feels to own or internalize the values and norms of the authorities, but through the attitude of approval of the subordination of self-controlled parties.

The hegemony of one group over other groups, in the Gramscian sense, is not forced. The hegemony must be achieved through political, cultural and intellectual efforts to create a shared worldview for the whole society. Gramsci’s political theory deals with the explanation of how ideas or ideologies become an instrument of dominance that gives the ruling class the legitimacy to rule. (Striniati 2004)

The hegemony concept of Antonio Gramsci is appropriate to describe the power relations between the powers of the ethnic, private, political elite and the elements of the city government and the subordinate apparatus (Patta & Mahpuddin 2011). For example, hegemonic discourse about the development of modern markets has formed an opinion in the community that the modern market development project act as a form of local governments’ awareness in building facilities or economic activities centers for the society. There has been a public perception that the ambitious project does not have a negative impact on society. Thus, for anyone who tries to challenge that policy immediately becomes the opponent for the public itself.

The Theory of Recognition

Axel Honneth provides a way of improving the deficit in Habermas's idea of practical discourse. Honneth argues that a pre-condition is required before stepping on the praxis of communication (discourse) that is recognition or respect. Respect is interpreted as an attitude of respecting and
affirming the existence of others in its cultural distinctiveness. There are three forms which indicate the loss of respect, that is (1) insult, which includes physical or psychological violence against a person through torture or rape; (2) denial of the subject's legality rights; (3) the destruction of self-confidence and self-esteem of people due to the low collectivity bond that ignores ethical and moral values. With respect, dialogue of interests will open up new hope for the achievement of a rational and fair consensus. (Honneth 1996)

The above theoretical picture implies an important message that the theory of recognition requires an inter-party relationship of interest, such as government, private parties and traders that can be reached by agreement, if each side has an attitude of respect for the other in its position and its interests.

The Discourse Theory

Habermas's Theory of Discourse has a strong relevance to this research. This theory is specifically used in two ways; (1) to criticize the policy structure that enables the creation of marginalization of street vendors; (2) offer a practical solution with emphasis on the process of negotiation between interested parties. The Discourse theory is used to test the legitimacy of rules on relocation policies issued by the government and its implementation steps. Policy analysis is not on its synchronous aspects with other rules, either vertically or horizontally. The analysis is done to reveal the ideology, interests and motives of the policy. In addition to examining its semantic structure, it also primarily investigates the process and its legitimacy.

Practical discourse is an initiative that comes from within the community itself. Habermas emphasized the importance of strengthening practical discourse through a mechanism called public communication procedure (public sphere). According to Habermas, at least there are a number of qualities that must be owned by a public sphere in order to avoid a systematic distortion of consensus-building processes that are carried out, namely:

1) In practical discourse, each participant must use the same language and abide by the language's logical and semantic rules so that it can be understood by all participants which allows for the interaction and meaning of an issue that can be dialogue to reach consensus.
2) The public domain must be guaranteed free from the influence of power and market intervention. In addition, within the public domain is also created the same power distribution between individuals involved in it. So the access to the area must be wide open for every citizen and no privileges are given to certain parties.

There have to be an agreement and common commitment to abide by the rules of operation of a rational discourse in which every truth claim can be tested for truth, accuracy and feasibility through rational rules. More importantly, the public domain must be free from distortions of political and economic play, primordialism, ethnocentrism and other narrow fanaticisms. (Hardiman 2010)

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This study utilize critical perspective by focusing on extracting information through a process of reciprocal dialogue with research subjects (Madison 2005). In addition to the dialogue with city government officials related to the market management, data also gathered from the street vendors who became victims of the merchant relocation policy (Bungin 2003). Broadly speaking, researchers chose the critical research operational steps according to Comstock (1980)are as follows:

a. Identifying progressive social groups and movements;
b. Developing all intersubjective relationships to understand the meaning, values, attitudes, experiences and motivations of the street vendors;
e. Studying the historical development of present social conditions and social structures that impede the street vendors’ struggle;

d. Formulating a clear interconnection model between social conditions through an intersubjective interpretation;

e. Describing fundamental (ideological) contradictions as the result of a research process based on comparative analysis of conditions with understanding, and ideological criticism.

f. Formulating a new strategy in fighting for the aspirations and interests of street vendors together with the research subjects.

The collected data will be analyzed critical-interpretatively which involves an intersubjective dialogue process with the subject of the study (W. Cresswell 2009).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

In 2010, there was a major fire incident in Manondamarket that burned most of the vendors along with merchant’s goods. A tragic event that happened for the umpteenth time. The pattern and mode of events resemble the past events, where there is a point of location experiencing a fire at the same time. The traders also suffered huge losses over the incident. The losses incurred not only concerning the property and the burned goods, but also marked a new difficulty to gain a place to sell in the next period.

After the fire reappeared old ideas from the city government that wanted to build the burned market facility. The elites of the municipality appear to have rhetorical comments to make the ambitious plan publicly accepted without any hindrance from any party. Through the local mass media network and the dissemination of rumor information that is taking place in interpersonal social relations, the reproductive discourse regarding the planned construction of market facilities continues.

No doubt that the creation of a new discourse becomes a strategic pattern often used by the city government in mitigating potential resistance from the merchants. Public acceptance of the market development plan is the target. The discourse contains an explanation of the reasons behind the post-fire rebuilding market plan. This includes an explanation of the benefits aspects that a merchant will gain if the market development is realized.

For that reason, traders are expected to be willing to be temporarily relocated to other places such as alongside the road around the market. But in reality, the discourse is always rejected by the traders. Responding to the issue of relocation, the traders perform counter-discourse action among traders themselves. There is spontaneously circulated issues of resistance which in essence implies a message that merchants will not be willing to be relocated. Through the spread of the issue, they are challenging the authorities by blockading the market entrance if the relocation plan remains imposed.

On February 17th 2016, the elected mayor of Palu was officially inaugurated, marking the emergence of a new regime which gave positive expectations in terms of managing the Manonda market. Merchants (especially for street vendors or PKL) put great hopes under the new mayor’s leadership to overcome the various chasms in the market, a crucial problem that has not been resolved since decades ago. In the midst of the collective pessimism of traders, the spirits to find a way to completely and comprehensively overcome some basic problems, such as: an indication of the strengthening of inter-ethnic economic prejudices and inequalities (immigrants and local people); and bad market management and indications of violence against street traders (PKL) as the impact of modernized traditional market development; grows.

The traders’ new expectations come not for no apparent reason. Palu Mayor, who has been democratically elected, is a figure who is asserted firmly but has no conflict of interest with the
management of the market in the past. Even in previous political campaigns, the Manonda market was one of the most important priorities to be addressed thoroughly.

After more than a year after the inauguration, policies on the market management began to produce real results. The first thing to do is to re-plan the implementation of the merchant relocation policy. In contrast to previous relocation policies based on such reasons as curbing, resolving roads or relocation related to the development plan of two storey shops; this time the reasoning is well-founded that the Palu City Government plans to conduct market arrangement starting from the road construction in the outer circle of the market. The conditions of damaged and unpaved roads look shabby, muddy and dusty. Such road conditions practically disrupt the mobility of citizens, inhibit the activity of traders, significantly reducing the beauty, execution operation is fully supported by the police even affecting the rate of the traffic. A number of reasons are used as a basis for argumentations to persuade the street vendors to be willing to be relocated inside the market.

Integrity and credibility, accompanied by a persuasive approach, is the main capital for a new political regime to reform the market. When it’s considered enough time to implement the relocation plan, Palu City Government intensified the socialization to street vendors. It is estimated that about one week before the road cleaning plan is carried out; no less than 8 Satpol PP officers are pro-actively socialize every day. Traders are encouraged and given sufficient time to voluntarily relocate before the deadline. During the socialization period, the traders were given an ultimatum so that the call for self-relocation did not go beyond the set time limit. The message is clear, if it is also ignored, the stalls will be forcibly demolished. On July 30th 2016, on behalf of the mayor’s instructions, Palu City Government mobilized around 200 Satpol PP personnel tasked to carry out forced eviction in the form of demolition of stalls owned by street vendors along the road in the outer circle of the Manonda market. The execution operation is fully supported by the police even involving elements of the military (TNI).

The relocation policy implementation, at the beginning stage, is considered successful. Most street vendors do not show a significant resistance to the execution of the curbing. They have no choice but to follow government instructions and are willing to enter the market. But there is a group of small-scale merchants choosing the path of direct physical confrontation. Physical clash between Satpol PP officers and street vendors occurred. Victims from both sides are inevitable.

Although there were no casualties, both from the traders and the Satpol PP officers experienced injuries. In fact, One of Satpol PP officers were abducted while performing the task and were brought into the market. In the market, dozens of traders alternately beat the officer, causing serious injury to the victim and had to be rushed to hospital for medical treatment.

Resistance arises mainly from the fish sellers. They can not accept a unilateral policy from the government. Some of the main reasons for their rejection are (1) the condition of the stalls spatial arrangement in the market, especially provided for fish traders, is not considered feasible in terms of health and comfort. The place is considered narrow, shabby, dark, stuffy and muddy, making traders feel uncomfortable in the long period of time; (2) these conditions have direct implications for the declining interest of visitors or prospective buyers to browse in the market stalls. As a result, the amount of income from the sales significantly decreased.

Similar conditions also occurred in the vegetable and fruit stalls. Unless the fruit-selling groups occupy space on the right of the front (western) side of the market, traders suffer a great deal of loss when the policy forces them to move into the market. One of the daily necessities products merchants provide testimonials;

"When selling outside (on the sidewalk), I can get maximum profit of IDR 16,000,000 monthly. But when I sell here (inside the market), my profit is just 2 to 3 million maximum per month." (Interview with the Sultan on April 14th 2018)
Many vegetables and fruits merchants (generally banana sellers) have to leave the privately owned stalls in the market because it is considered not profitable. Some of them have income rate of 7 to 10 thousand rupiahs a day. To be able to maintain the continuity of their business, they are forced to rent shops located on the outside of the market that has not been used by the owners.

The merchants get around the cost of renting a shop, which is quite expensive, by forming a group consisting of 10 people per shops. In the corner of the market, the cost of rent per shop can reach 8 million Rupiahs a month. While on the other part, the rent is at least 5 million Rupiahs per month. Routine expenditures for the shop rent per month were chosen as the last alternative to keep their business. As for some traders with limited financial capability or disadvantaged because they do not get a limited number of shops, they have to get out of the market. Among them, there are those who move to sell to other locations, but not a few who choose to completely quit as a market trader.

Disappointment over the treatment of the new city government was felt. Instead of getting a fair solution, the merchants feel a firmness of officer attitudes that can be qualified as an act of reproducing new violence following the pattern of forced handling as in the past.

If violence is interpreted in a broad spectrum, then the indication is not only limited to the problem of physical violence events during the street vendors control operation. At the subtle violence level, its incarnated in any non-physical actions that have the effect of anxiety, fear, psychic pressure on others (Wirawan, 1996). In the early stages, Palu City Government takes the persuasive path in solving the problems of street vendors. The socialization agenda on merchant relocation plans requires a rational basis for strong rational argument to be accepted voluntarily. The municipal authorities performing these duties are the instruments of the government's truth, from the apparatus point of view (Hardiman, 2009). Its mission is the acceptance of the government version of discourse without the deployment of coercive, physical forces.

The trader aspiration is positioned as a marginal discourse that lacks effective power to be heard and considered in the context of formulating a market management policy. In the end, the government's version of discourse appears as an official discourse that marginalizes the aspirations of traders. The traders are conditioned in such a way that they do not reject the the City Government's relocation idea. At this stage, the state's dominance is manifested in the form of hegemony, which is the stage of acceptance of state discourse without forced effort.

When socialization is not optimal, the City Government mobilizes a coercive approach to force street vendors to enter the market. The enforced effort has earned its legitimacy on the dominance of the local government's version of discourse. A hegemonial discourse that places the attitude and actions of the merchant's resistance as a disobedience attempt which connotes negatively such as: stubborn, unruly, against the law and so on.

At a glance, the municipality of Palu appears to have good intentions to avoid violence or coercive attempts. But it is not realized that it is possible to open up a fair space of dialogue in order to find the right solution while fulfilling the sense of justice. The government should ideally seek a more permanent solution by calling on all stakeholders. The path of dialogue will be long and tiring, but it can minimize the violence that may be chosen as a last resort attempt.

The government should play the mediator role who opens the discussion space as widely as possible to the aspirations of merchants who resist the relocation or the private parties who want otherwise, so it can be found a fair agreement. The fundamental mistake of the old mayor's leadership did not seem to be fundamentally corrected by the new mayor's leadership regime. The choice of strategy and operational approach is seen as progressing from the persuasive handling aspect, but from the perspective option does not provide a fundamental solution. Attempts to enforce a worldview still follow the old pattern that the government has the right to set unilateral policies without significant inclusion of those parties who feel sacrificed.
A change of perspective is a factor that must be realized by the City Government if a permanent solution is truly desired. The parties who play the role of antagonism should be viewed as equal parties and have the right to negotiate their interests. City government must throw away cynicism and disrespect toward traders. This attitude will open an unequal discussion. The aspirations of the traders must be heard and considered proportionally by the private sector and the city government (Hajar 2013).

Some important aspirations of the merchants are marginalized by the power of discourse domination and hegemony of city government perspective, among others: (1) basically traders do not want confrontational attitudes as long as their interests are heard and appreciated in the form of concrete actions. They demanded a systemic or comprehensive overhaul of market management before the merchant relocation policy was implemented; (2) Government and private parties must involve traders as stakeholders related to the formulation of merchant relocation policy.

To address the demands of the traders mentioned above, the City Government is required to develop respect as an important condition in building persuasive communication. Persuasive communication is a form of communication that relies on the ability to influence others by touching the psychological aspects not for manipulative purposes, but an effort to build mutual understanding of sincere, honest and equitable mutuality. The starting point begins with respect and open attitude in which each communication participant has good intentions and shared desire to solve problems that become obstacles in the relationship between the concerned parties.

The above description contains an explanation of the deliberation of the public which contains the spirit of partnership and equality between the government and the public in handling various public issues. Efforts to resolve the disastrous management of Manonda's market are now increasingly complex that demands fair and equitable engagement of interested parties. The fundamental weakness of the City Government policy in the past, especially by the attitude of the City Government who feels full power, is to ignore the public participation of traders in the process of policy formulation.

In real-political aspect, the principle of equality is not easily manifest. The parties come with their own agenda of interest. The ultimate goal is to win the battle of interests by taking various ways to keep the parties in their own stance. As a result, conflicts of interest will be difficult to avoid. In such situations, strength (money and power) is usually a crucial factor.

Discourse is a normative and effective procedure in dealing with any conflict between the concerned parties. It is hard to imagine that the negotiations that are held through discourse are only about to reach a mere consensus. Every party involved in discourse comes with their own interests.

The interest is not something isolated between one discourse participants with other participants. Precisely because of different interests, negotiations are held to find a condition of mutual interest that goes beyond self-interest. Each related party has the right to formulate and declare its own interests without force from an outside party, but by each concerned parties. In other words, no one can recognize interests more adequately except by the interested parties themselves.

The street vendors, for example, have interests that must be recognized and formulated from within the individual street vendor's themselves rather than departed from outside. In fact, the unilateral formulation of the PKL's interests is often coercively enforced from outside through the path of mental violence or physical violence. Since the beginning of the establishment of Manonda Market, the nomenclature change from the Inpresmarket has become a central market and even the latest policy to turn it into modernized traditional market (Patra-Modern), makes the street vendors forced to accept the formulation of their interests from the outside. As a result, there is a resistance from street vendors in various forms, such as demonstration actions, spreading rumors of local government officials, or even physical resistance that cause casualties from Satpol PP. Nevertheless,
street vendor resistance remains ineffective insignificantly stemming or changing the direction of government policy.

The problems of street vendors that are not yet resolved, require the wisdom of all parties involved in it. The Palu City Government in particular who undoubtedly assume the role of advisory services for the public requires openness attitude on the problem of street vendors, as the attitude of the city government in the past tends to side with PT Sari Dewi Membangun. Similarly, the involvement of Satpol PP, elements of the police and the military (TNI) in the process of detaining street vendors that emphasize repressive approaches by relying on the action of coercive enforcement may be used as the last resort. Persuasive dialogue becomes a priority choice that must be continued.

Persuasive efforts are realized optimally through effective communication procedures. As a pre-requisite of communication, there are at least two positive attitudes that must be developed both in the street vendors as well as among market managers (government and private parties) for communication praxis to be conducted:

1. Recovering mutual trust relationships. Particularly to the government and private parties as market management partners should initiate concrete steps towards creating a pattern of trusting relationships.

2. Respectational attitudes form the basis of the realization of equality of relations pattern in which interested parties have the opportunity to develop relationships in a positive direction. From this point is the start of the communication praxis that various things related to the formulation of market management policy (including street vendor relocation) can be optimized.

Respect attitude is not easily realized in the middle of segregation or stiff pattern of diametral relationship between street vendors and market managers, thus become a challenge for the city government to start concrete steps in realizing this positive attitude. The government can develop a pattern of cultural approaches, namely to build communication from the inside. The process often takes a relatively long time but the results tend to be more permanent. The government must show concrete evidence that can be used as a basis for building trust (Mamar, et. al. 2008). For example, rearranging more viable stalls within the market.

After a persuasive effort is optimally done, then the communication praxis that carries an important theme on the arrangement of street vendors in the market will find the right context. Praxis communication or discourse is done by considering some important normative requirements, among others: (1) Inviting all parties concerned to engage in negotiations, thus making all involved parties as an equal partner of communication that have the same voting rights without exception; (2) Each discourse participant is morally ingrained the mutual awareness and commitment to find solutions for the problems and fulfill the principle of justice for all; (3) The discourse room must be guaranteed its neutrality from the influence of the use of money and power so that every discourse participants have the freedom to express their aspirations without pressure or intimidation; (4) Each participant has equal opportunity to deliver different aspirations for the interests of others; (5) Each participant has the right and obligation to comply with established communication procedures; (6) The results of a joint decision shall be accepted and followed by all parties present or representing their respective interests.

Without denying the possibility of a decision that has not reached an ideal level for all parties due to various factors and reasons, at least the negotiation process has been carried out in an open process without coercion and violence. The result of the joint decision is not the final formula forever, because there is an opportunity to question again if it is proven to be ineffective because it harms a particular party and benefits the other side.
CONCLUSION

In the early phase of Manonda Traditional Market establishment, social relations among traders and their relation with government is relatively harmonious. It changes when entering the 1990’s era, when government policies that give authority to the private sector to manage market facilities emerge. Since then, violence has occurred to traders. Fires, forced relocations, to physical and mental violence continue to this day. The merchants who originally had a decent place to sell their goods become nomadic and attached to the identity as a street vendor (PKL).

The street vendor relocation policy brings serious economic implications. In the context of creating a conducive climate within the market, it is necessary for the municipal government to conduct a thorough evaluation of the market management system that is suspected to have severely affecting the economic and cultural sense of justice. Partnership in dialogue must be realized based on discourse mechanisms in each negotiation space to reach agreement and common ground that fairly benefits all parties.

To achieve a level of equal partnership, the city government and private parties require wisdom by promoting respect in every step of policy making regarding market management. A necessary inner disposition as a precondition before initiating the praxis of intersubjective communication with the parties concerned. However, such respectful attitudes can only be realized if decision-makers are willing to set aside the ambitions of private or group economic and political interests.

REFERENCE

Mahpuddin,
Department of Communication Studies,
Faculty of Social and Political Sciences,
Tadulako University, Palu, Indonesia
Email: mahpuddin_untad@yahoo.co.id

Ilyas Lampe,
Department of Communication Studies,
Faculty of Social and Political Sciences,
Tadulako University, Palu, Indonesia
Email: ilyaslampe7@gmail.com

Sumarni Zainuddin
Department of Communication Studies,
Faculty of Social and Political Sciences,
Email: sumarnijuraij@gmail.com

Muchri Ramah
Department of Communication Studies,
Faculty of Social and Political Sciences,
Tadulako University, Palu, Indonesia
Email: muchriramah88@gmail.com

Israwaty Suryadi
Department of Communication Studies,
Faculty of Social and Political Sciences,
Tadulako University, Palu, Indonesia
Email: izrawatys@gmail.com

Submitted: July, 16, 2018
Accepted: August, 14, 2018