

## ANALYSIS OF REGIONAL DEVELOPMENT PLANNING COORDINATION IMPLEMENTATION IN PALU CITY

*(ANALISIS PELAKSANAAN KOORDINASI PERANCANGAN  
PEMBANGUNAN WILAYAH DI BANDAR PALU)*

Abunawas Tjaija

### Abstract

---

This Research focus in the implementation on the regional development planning by the Palu City's Sub-National Level Development Planning Agency (BAPPEDA). In this case, Palu City government act as coordinator of the regional development plans. The data in this research are collected through questionnaire, deep-interviews and document and literature reviews. Collected data are analyzed descriptively. This research shows that Palu City government as a regional development plans coordinator have not efficiently act and need further optimization. The reason of this seemingly low work efficiency of Palu City government is because the limited organizational ability, fund and cost, human resources, and miscommunication between authority and regulations as one of Palu City's Sub-National Level Development Planning Agency (BAPPEDA) duties is to coordinate various development planning, technical and general planning of agencies in Palu City. Development plans that favour sectoral development planning is also contributing as one of many factors that desynchronize on-going development projects in various areas. Thus, the desynchronization makes many plans or projects become overlapped with one another, even between other agencies. The results show that the participation and communication between Palu City government agencies are not well coordinated.

---

**Keywords:** Implementation, Organizational Communication, Coordination, Regional Development Planning.

### Abstrak

---

Penyelidikan ini menumpukan kepada pelaksanaan perancangan pembangunan wilayah oleh Badan Perencanaan Pembangunan Tingkat Bawah Tanah (BAPPEDA) Tingkat Nasional, Palu. Dalam hal ini, Pemerintah Bandar Palu bertindak sebagai koordinator perencanaan pembangunan daerah. Data dalam kajian ini dikumpulkan melalui soal selidik, tinjauan mendalam dan tinjauan dokumen dan literatur. Data yang dikumpulkan dianalisis secara deskriptif. Kajian ini menunjukkan bahawa Pemerintah Bandar Palu sebagai koordinator pembangunan wilayah tidak bertindak dengan lancar dan memerlukan pengoptimalan lanjut. Alasan kecekapan kerja yang seolah-olah rendah ini adalah disebabkan oleh keupayaan organisasi, dana dan kos, sumber manusia, dan kelemahan komunikasi antara pihak berkuasa dan peraturan sebagai salah satu tugas dari Badan Perencanaan Pembangunan Tingkat Bawah Tanah (BAPPEDA) di Bandar Palu bagi menyelaraskan pelbagai perancangan pembangunan, perancangan teknikal dan umum agensi di Bandar Palu. Pelan pembangunan yang berkaitan dengan perancangan

*pembangunan adalah hanya tertumpu kepada sektor pilihan sahaja yang mana menyumbang kepada salah satu faktor punca menyederhanakan projek-projek pembangunan yang berterusan di pelbagai bidang. Oleh itu, penyusunan semula membuat banyak rancangan atau projek menjadi bertindih antara satu sama lain, bahkan antara agensi lain. Keputusan menunjukkan bahawa penyertaan dan komunikasi antara agensi kerajaan Bandar Palu tidak diselaraskan dengan baik.*

---

**Kata Kunci:** *Pelaksanaan, Komunikasi Organisasi, Penyelarasan, Perancangan Pembangunan Wilayah*

## INTRODUCTION

As development planning that designed based on the approach seems ideal and can give birth to development programs in regarding the demands and needs of the community in accordance with the scale of urgent development priorities in a region. Thus to be able to use the limited existing development funds in carrying out the regional development. Moreover, with good coordination among the elements of development ideally the development results will be in accordance with the expectations of all communities.

For coordination processes, Regional Development Agency (*Badan Pembangunan Daerah*, abbreviated as BAPPEDA) of Palu City as one of development planning agency holds a key role, for the success of development in Palu city.

However, based on the empirical experience of the author in Palu City, the design of the development planning approach is in fact still experiencing various problems. One of the causes, is the implementation of coordination that has not optimally run. Inadequate implementation of development in Palu City is due to limited organizational capacity (cost, human resource and regulatory authority) of BAPPEDA in coordinating various development planning especially concerning general and technical planning, which is distributed among various institutions.

There are several Regional/City Services that are more concerned with sectoral development planning. Thus, development projects synchronization directed to certain areas often does not work well and there is even a tendency to overlap programs between agencies. This shows that the level of agency participation in implementing development coordination is not going well.

In addition, the weakness of development coordination activities is due to the monitoring and evaluation activities that are still rarely performed and reviewed to the project implementing agency. So, if various imbalances in the field are found, to measure the development success parameters is still difficult to do, although the indicator of development success usually measured by how much the project completion target is and not by the implications of the project implementation. There are often found development projects directed at an area that normally can not be functioned by the local community or for the needs of regional development.

## LITERATURE REVIEW

### Implementation

Implementation as stated by Jones (1984) in a simple and easy to understand manner, *take a job to be done*. A very simple definition because it is only a term. But the term requires the involvement of many people, money and skills or available organizations. In other words implementation is a process that requires extra resources in order to solve work problems.

Implementation, as proposed by Edward (1980), is part of the policy-making process, after which a policy is established and legitimized, consequently the policy will be applied with a view to influencing the community.

Allison and Abdullah (Abdullah, 1988) stated that:

*Implementation is an important and critical stage that requires the cooperation of all parties in the preparation and execution of a policy. Before a program or project is carried out, careful preparation is done to all matters of the project, such as the organization, the workforce including the qualifications of the persons involved, and the equipment and work procedures that are crucial on all parties involved. In the project management cycle, after the preparatory steps and approval of the authorities, there is an implementation stage which is the operationalization of predetermined decisions .*

## **Coordination**

Coordination is one of the functions of management among other functions such as planning, organizing, moving and controlling (Moekijat, 1994). The function of coordination is to connect the unit that exist within the organization or between organizations. Therefore, an institution or organization can not function properly if coordination is not properly implemented.

Husnan (1989) states that coordination as a process to integrate various objectives and activities of different organizational units or departments in order to achieve the organization's goals efficiently. Without a coordination between employees and departments within the organization, they will lose sight of their roles.

According to Suganda (1991), coordination is the unification of the motion of all potential and organizational units or organizations of different functions in order to actually lead to the same goal in order to facilitate its achievement efficiently.

Westra (1982) stated that coordination in the implementation of general government tasks is distinguished in hierarchical (vertical) coordination and functional coordination. Hierarchical coordination is the coordination performed by a leadership official in a government agency against an officer (official) or subordinate agency. While the functional coordination is coordination conducted by a leadership official or an other agency whose field of duty is interrelated based on functional principles. This is because an organizational unit may not be able to do its own work without the help of other organizational units. In other words, functional coordination must be done because the other organizational units have a functional relationship in the implementation of the main tasks.

## **Planning**

Planning is the first, even the main, function in any management or administrative activities. Planning is the basis or starting point in implementing administrative actions.

Kunarto (1996) stated that planning is a preparation of a set of decisions to be implemented in the future which will be directed to a particular goal. The definition means that planning has elements as follows: (a) relating to the future; (b) organizing a systematic set of activities; and (c) is designed to achieve a particular goal. Thus the planning is often arranged to solve a particular problem at a certain time as well.

Siagian (Silalahi, 1987) argues that planning is as a whole process of thinking and determining the things that will be done in the future to achieve the set goals.

## **Development**

Gunnar Myrdal (Kartasasmita, 1997), stated that:

1. Development is the movement of improvement of the whole system, where economic improvement will bring social equity and justice.

2. Development is a change towards the pattern of life and better human values, where there is control of the environment and the development itself.
3. Development not only relies on technology and GNP, but also on reaching new knowledge and skills, growing new awareness, developing the horizon of thinking, encouraging and injecting human belief in its ability.

Development, as stated by Tjokroamidjojo (1987), is as follows: Development is a continuous renewal process from a certain circumstance to a situation that is considered better.

Ndraha (1990) defines development as a series of business or growth and change that the plan is made consciously by a nation, state and government toward modernity in the framework of nation building.

## RESEARCH METHODS

This research will be conducted in BAPPEDA Office of Palu City. This research's samples, determined by purposive sampling, are all leaders and employees at the office of BAPPEDA Kota Palu (32 people in total) as follows: 1. Chairman of BAPPEDA (1), Secretary of BAPPEDA (1), Section Head (4), Sub-Section Head (4), Staff/ Employees (10) and Head of Sub-District (12).

Primary data are data obtained from respondents involved in the coordination of development planning. While secondary data are data obtained from the documents of planning coordination activities in Palu City that comes from the data collection and reports of each agency concerned.

Data collected through:

- a. Observation, i.e. data collected through direct observation of the object of research to see the implementation of development planning coordination by BAPPEDA Palu City.
- b. Interview, data collected through unrestrained interviews to a number of respondents to explore further research indicators,
- c. Documentation, i.e. the systematic recording of several observation objects (documents), which are considered supporting the research activities.

Collected data are analyzed using Qualitative and Descriptive Statistics analysis. Qualitative analysis is intended to describe the variables studied. While Descriptive Statistics analysis is used to explain the variables and indicators expressed in either frequency with absolute value, as well as with percentage value (Sugiyono, 2013).

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

### The Capacity of BAPPEDA to Coordinate the Development Planning

Coordination is one of the main tasks that must be done by BAPPEDA of Palu City. This main task must be well implemented, because it concerns the performance of BAPPEDA internationally and the success of development in Palu City. In the BAPPEDA's strategic planning of 2004, it was also mentioned that one of the measures of the success of BAPPEDA's programs and activities is its success in coordinating development planning with various agencies located in Palu City.

There are several indicators that are used as a measure of BAPPEDA's ability to coordinate; a) identifying linkages and agency interests, b) integrating similar and related activities, c)

synchronizing the schedule of activities, d) following the developments in agency planning, and e) providing guidances.

Each of the above indicators will be analyzed so as to give a real description of the ability of BAPPEDA Palu in coordinating various programs with various agencies.

#### 1. Identifying Linkages and Interests of Agencies

Table 1. Identification of Linkages and Interests of Institutions by Bappeda Kota Palu

Category	Value	Frequency	Percentage (%)
Very Appropriate	(3)	4	12.5
Appropriate	(2)	10	31.25
Less Appropriate	(1)	17	53.13
Inappropriate	(0)	1	3.13
Total		32	100.00

Source: Primary Data

To identify the linkages and interests of agencies is one of the objectives of development planning coordination activities in Palu City.

Based on the questions posed to a number of respondents, it is known that 4 respondents or 12.5% stated that the indicator identifies the relevance and importance of agencies is very appropriate, 10 respondents or 31.25% stated appropriate, 17 respondents stated less appropriate and 1 or 3.13% of respondents stated inappropriate.

Based on Table 1, it appears that most respondents or 53.13% stated that the activity of identifying linkages and agency interests by BAPPEDA Palu is categorized as inappropriate because respondents believe that BAPPEDA officials are not supported by their technical capability in identifying various development programs. For example, technical capability about residential and regional infrastructure.

The 31.25% respondents states accordingly, as BAPPEDA has done the task well of identifying the linkages and interests of agencies in integrating development programs, especially programs or projects related to the economic field.

Furthermore, 12.5 % respondents stated very appropriate, because BAPPEDA Palu City has well identified the linkages and interests of various programs in various agencies in the city of Palu.

While 3.13 % respondents stated inappropriate. The reason is that the role and function of BAPPEDA in the coordination of development planning is merely to collect proposed programs or projects that come from the agency without proper identification. So that sometimes the programs that appear in the APBD or Project Proposed List are not in line with the aspirations expected by agencies and the presence of certain sectors that dominate existing programs or projects.

From the total answers of the respondents above illustrates that, substantially, BAPPEDA Palu has not conducted identifying linkages and agency interests activities very well. This is because the technical capability of BAPPEDA Palu is low. Although BAPPEDA Palu has institutional arrangements or organizational structures by adding and changing into five areas: Strategic Planning Sector, Development Planning I, Development Planning II, Development Planning III, and Sub-Regional Development Planning. But because the field is gradually decreasing, the officers still have

difficulty to make adjustment of task relation with programs coming from technical institutions in Palu City.

## 2. Integrating Similar and Related Activities

Table 2. Activities of Palu City Bappeda in Combining Similar and Related Activities

Category	Value	Frequency	Percentage (%)
Very Appropriate	(3)	8	25
Appropriate	(2)	7	21.88
Less Appropriate	(1)	14	43.75
Inappropriate	(0)	3	9.38
Total		32	100.00

Source: Primary Data

Table 2 shows activities that combine similar activities and related activities conducted by BAPPEDA Palu City, most of them are less suitable category, that is 14 respondents or 43.75 %. Then followed by 25.00 % respectively which states very appropriate, appropriate category 21.88 % and inappropriate category to 9.38 %.

The reason of the respondents stated that the activity of combining similar and related activities less appropriate (43.75 %) is because BAPPEDA Palu apparatus are not yet optimal in executing the various activities. This can be seen from the output of programs that have been generated. Based on interviews conducted to BAPPEDA officials in Palu City, one of the causes of the weakness of activities to integrate various similar programs is one of the causes because the program plans coming from technical agencies are often late submitted to BAPPEDA, so BAPPEDA is having difficulties coordinating similar programs which come from various agencies.

Furthermore, 25% respondents stated that BAPPEDA Palu, in combining various similar and related activities, is very appropriate because the activities are carried out in accordance with the mechanism and or the Technical Guideline of Palu City development planning.

21.88% respondents states that it is appropriate because the District/ City BAPPEDA in integrating similar plan activities has considered various aspects of the planning, such as the relationship between the program or project, the level of project needs and so on.

Then the 19.38 % of respondents states that it is appropriate because BAPPEDA is less able to integrate similar programs or projects and related to several agencies. This is apparent at the time of the program plan, and there are still overlapping projects. Even on deconcentrated projects and projects financed by the General Allocation Fund (DAU), are in one location even though the goals and objectives of the project have in common.

From interviews with respondents revealed that, the cause and the low or lack of ability of BAPPEDA in combining similar and related activities because, among others; a) BAPPEDA officials are rigid in adapting and implementing existing implementation and technical guidelines, b) BAPPEDA officials lack coordination with project or program owners whose funds are derived from de-concentration funds, c) implementation guidance and technical guidance on program or project mechanisms received are not on time, d) the weakness of HR planners, due to lack of follow-up planning training.

The implications of BAPPEDA's inability to incorporate similar and related activities are that BAPPEDA only collects activities derived from agencies, in the form of a list of proposed projects without well coordinating among the relevant agencies.

In certain cases, although the District Development Planning has been implemented to integrate various programs, but at the time of making DURPs for RAPBDs, it is sometimes overlooked. This is due to three factors; a) when the assigned BAPPEDA apparatus of the development planning meeting is unable to grasp the growing aspirations in the forum on the proposed programs/ projects, b) often the agency makes program changes, even though it has been agreed in the forum. This happens because the lack of firmness.

### 3. Synchronizing Institution Activities Schedule

Respondent's statement about the activities of BAPPEDA Kota Palu in synchronizing schedule of agency activities can be seen in the following table:

Table 3. Synchronizing Institution Activities Schedule by Bappeda Kota Palu

Category	Value	Frequency	Percentage (%)
Very Appropriate	(3)	5	15.63
Appropriate	(2)	11	34.38
Less Appropriate	(1)	14	43.75
Inappropriate	(0)	2	6.25
Total		32	100.00

Source: Primary Data

Based on Table 3, it appears that the number of respondents who stated that the synchronization of agency activity schedule by BAPPEDA Palu are very appropriate are 5 respondents or 15.63 %, 11 respondents or 34.38 % stated appropriate, 14 respondents or 43.75 % stated less appropriate, and 2 respondents or 6.25 % stated inappropriate.

43.75 % of respondents was stated less appropriate in coordinating the schedule of agency activities, because the respondents argued that BAPPEDA Palu was often unable to keep the schedule of activities that have been proposed by the relevant agency. Thus affecting the schedule of the process of implementation of activities in the field.

34.38 % respondents stated appropriate because BAPPEDA has decisive attitude toward the conclusions that have been made, because sometimes the influence of leadership at the top level also becomes an obstacle factor in the process of planning formulation.

15.63 % respondents stated that it is very appropriate because BAPPEDA has considered the project or program implementation by making the time schedule for the implementation of the project of each agency, the timetable for disbursement, monitoring and evaluation (monev) schedule for the projects implemented by each agencies and other technical factors.

6.25 % respondents stated inappropriate because respondents considered that BAPPEDA Palu is unable to make the right schedule according to project budget disbursement schedule.

Based on the above analysis, it is described that BAPPEDA Palu, in synchronizing the schedule of agency activities, is not appropriate because of the reason for the implementation schedule of activities starting from the implementation planning process.

#### 4. Following The Developments In Agency Planning

Statement of respondents regarding the extent of the activities of BAPPEDA Kota Palu in following the development planning of each agency can be presented in the table as follows:

Table 4. Activities of BappedaPalu in Following Institution Development Planning

Category	Value	Frequency	Percentage (%)
Very Appropriate	(3)	7	21.86
Appropriate	(2)	10	31.25
Less Appropriate	(1)	13	40.63
Inappropriate	(0)	2	6.25
Total		32	100.00

Source: Primary Data

Based on the above table, it appears that the respondent's statement on the activities of BAPPEDA Palu in following the development of agency planning is; 7 respondents or 21.86 % stated very appropriate, 10 respondents or 31.25 % stated appropriate, 13 respondents or 40.63 % stated less appropriate, and 2 respondents or 6.25 % stated inappropriate.

40.63 % respondents stated that appropriate to the activities of BAPPEDA Palu in following the development of agency planning, because activities related to monitoring by BAPPEDA is less effective or unable to meet the target. It can be seen from the existence of uncontrolled programs or projects, especially sectoral programs.

31.25 % respondents stated that it is appropriate because BAPPEDA Palu has followed the activity of disbursement planning and monitoring and evaluation (money) patterns are always changing.

21.86 % respondents stated that it is very appropriate because the BAPPEDA Palu have done very well in carrying out the monitoring activities of agency planning in accordance with the existing planning mechanism. 6.25 % percentage states that it is inappropriate because BAPPEDA is unable to conduct monitoring activities on a regular basis, even if it is just a formality, without being followed up properly.

The dominant category is less appropriate category, indicating that BAPPEDA Palu is unable to monitor the planning done by the agency. Based on the interviews and observations made, the lack of ability is caused by; a) the technical planners that exist in each agency are less able to formulate their strategic activities, thus affecting the performance of BAPPEDA. For example, BAPPEDA has made its mailing and meeting efforts but the departments/services program plans are late to be submitted or not even submitted. This greatly affects the work program that must be completed by BAPPEDA Palu; b) the workload of BAPPEDA Palu is quite high, so monitoring activities are less focused.

#### Supporting and Inhibiting Factors of Development Planning Coordination

##### 1. Supporting Factors

The number of employees of BAPPEDA Palu is currently quite enough for the activities of the Regional Development Planning Board (BAPPEDA) of Palu City, totaling up to 43 people. The

following table (Table 5) represents the statement of respondents regarding the number of human resources in BAPPEDA Palu City.

Table 5. Respondents Statement Regarding the Number of Human Resources in BappedaPalu

Category	Value	Frequency	Percentage (%)
Excessive	(3)	5	1.63
Sufficient	(2)	20	62.50
Scant	(1)	7	21.88
Scarce	(0)	0	0.00
Total		32	100.00

Source: Primary Data

The above table shows that the respondent's statement about the number (quantitative) of employees in BAPPEDA Palu. 5 respondents or 1.63 % stated excessive. The reason is that 42 people is too much and inefficient. Then 62.50 % respondents stated that it is sufficient.

The number of employees are scattered in six areas that include Secretarial Division, Strategic Plan (Renstra), Development Planning I, Development Planning II, Development Planning III, and Sub-Regional Development Planning Division. In details, there are one people of echelon II, 6 people echelon III, and 19 people echelon IV.

The quantity of Human Resources existence is sufficient to support development planning activities in Palu City, especially in carrying out the duties and functions of BAPPEDA from development planning process, coordination, evaluation and monitoring.

The last 21.88% respondents stated that the number of employees in BAPPEDA can not support the implementation of development coordination.

## 2. Inhibiting Factors

Although in terms of quantity of the employees BAPPEDA Palu is enough to support BAPPEDA's activities in carrying out planning activities.

Table 6. Respondents Statement Regarding the Quality of Human Resources of BappedaPalu

Category	Value	Frequency	Percentage (%)
Excessive	(3)	2	6.25
Sufficient	(2)	9	28.13
Scant	(1)	19	59.38
Scarce	(0)	2	6.25
Total		32	100.00

Source: Processed Primary Data, 2009

Based on the table above, it can be seen that the opinion of 19 respondents (59.38 %) regarding the quality of human resources of BAPPEDA is less qualified. The reason is that the development planning and coordination by BAPPEDA is still not optimal. Then the opinion of the 9 respondents (28.13 %) stated that the employees are qualified because BAPPEDA Kota Palu has done well in the planning and coordination of the development. 2 respondents (6.25 %) stated that the employees are highly qualified, because BAPPEDA has done planning and coordination

according to development archetypes and regional development programs, and integrate them with the activities of agencies and regional needs.

The last 6.25% of respondents stated that the employees are not qualified because the development planning by BAPPEDA Palu which is not in accordance with agency planning still exists.

Some factors causing poor quality of human resources are caused by the level of employees' education which is still low. Based on observations from a number of employees who heavily participate in the development planning and coordination, but is still very low in terms of quality. This is one of the inhibiting factors for the performance of BAPPEDA Palu. There are only 3 employees qualified by master degree, 11 are bachelor degree and the rest are high school graduate/equivalent.

## CONCLUSION

Based on the results of the research on the problems raised in the previous section, it can be concluded that in coordinating development planning by using six indicators, that is identifying linkages and agency interests; integrating similar and related activities; synchronizing the schedule of activities; following the developments in agency planning; and providing guidances; on average is in accordance with the level of ability of BAPPEDA. Because the average score reached is 1.52 or 52.56 %. However, the six indicators; identifying linkages and agency interests; integrating similar and related activities; synchronizing the schedule of activities; following the developments in agency planning; and providing guidances; need to be continuously improved implementation.

Supporting factors for the implementation of development planning coordination in Palu City are the aspects of the quantity of human resources of BAPPEDA and the regulation of facilities and infrastructure and technology support. While the inhibiting factors include the quality of human resources, funding and information systems planning aspects.

## SUGGESTIONS

Based on the conclusions that have been described above, it is suggested to improve the ability of BAPPEDA Palu in implementing development planning in Palu City. It is necessary to improve the quality of Human Resources BAPPEDA Palu City through the improvement of technical training, and the increase of formal education level at Masters level (S2) and Doctorate level (S3). In addition, it is also necessary to improve the information system of development planning by utilizing information technology. Also, a better coordination system is needed as the implementation of sanctions for the leadership of agencies who are less participated in the development planning, and various rules related to development planning in Palu City needs to be socialized.

## REFERENCES

- Abdullah. 1988. *Kumpulan Makalah Administrasi Pembangunan*. Ujung Pandang: Fisipol UNHAS.
- Edward. 1980. Implementing Public Policy. In *Policy, Implementation, and Bureaucracy*. New York: The Dorsey Press.
- Husnan, S. 1989. *Manajemen Pokok-Pokok Pengertian dan Soal Jawab*. BPFE: Yogyakarta.
- Jones, C. O. 1984. *An Introduction to The Study of Public Policy*. California: Brooks Cole Publishing Company.
- Kartasmita, G. 1997. *Administrasi Pembangunan, Perkembangan Pemikiran dan Praktiknya di Indonesia*. Jakarta: PL3ES.
- Kunarto. 1996. *Sejarah Perencanaan Pembangunan; Suatu Tinjauan Singkat*. Jakarta: Prisma.
- Moekijat. 1994. *Koordinasi, Suatu Tinjauan Teoritis*. Bandung: Mandar Maju.
- Ndraha, T. 1990. *Pembangunan Masyarakat Mempersiapkan Masyarakat Tinggal Landas*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta.

- Silalahi, A. 1987. *Studi Tentang Ilmu Administrasi*. Bandung: Sinar Baru.
- Suganda, D. 1991. *Koordinasi Alat Pemersatu untuk Administrasi*. Jakarta: Intermedia.
- Sugiyono. 2013. *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif dan R & D*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Tjokroamidjojo, B. 1987. *Perencanaan Pembangunan*. Jakarta: Gunung Agung.
- Westra, P. 1982. *Ensiklopedi Adminsitasi*. Jakarta: Gunung Agung

Abunawas Tjaija  
Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Tadulako University  
Jl. Soekarno Hatta Km 9, Palu, 94116, Indonesia  
Email: tjaijaabu@yahoo.com

Submitted: July, 13, 2018  
Accepted: August, 14, 2018

