

Keberkesanan Sarikata sebagai Fasilitator untuk Pembelajaran Bahasa dalam Penguatkuasaan Perbendaharaan Kata dan Pemahaman dalam Kalangan Penutur Bahasa Inggeris sebagai Bahasa Kedua

The Efficiency of Subtitles as a Facilitator for Language Learning in Vocabulary Acquisition and Comprehension amongst ESL Speakers

Muhammad Izzul Aniq Bin Hasrin
Nadzrah Abu Bakar

Pengajian Bahasa Inggeris
Fakulti Sains Sosial Dan Kemanusiaan,
Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia

nadz@ukm.edu.my

ABSTRAK

Perbendaharaan kata merupakan kaedah penting untuk bertukar idea dan memperoleh pengalaman baru. Kekurangan pengetahuan dalam perbendaharaan kata akan menyebabkan penutur Bahasa Inggeris sebagai bahasa kedua, kurang memahami bahasa tersebut. Bahan audiovisual yang dipertingkatkan dengan penggunaan sarikata adalah alat pedagogi yang baik, dipercayai mampu memudahkan pemahaman. Kajian ini menyiasat keadaan sarikata yang paling berkesan dalam memudahkan pemerolehan perbendaharaan kata dan pemahaman di kalangan penutur Bahasa Inggeris sebagai bahasa kedua di Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia, Bangi. Kajian ini juga bertujuan untuk mengenal pasti sama ada pelajar memperoleh prestasi secara berbeza bergantung pada tahap kemahiran mereka dan untuk menentukan persepsi pelajar tentang penggunaan sarikata untuk pembelajaran bahasa. 10 orang pelajar prasiswazah dengan tahap kemahiran Bahasa Inggeris yang berbeza berdasarkan skor MUET mereka, telah digunakan untuk kajian ini. Peserta diminta menonton empat video dari sebuah sitkom Amerika bertajuk "How I Met Your Mother" dengan setiap video diberi sari kata yang berlainan (L2 = sarikata Bahasa Inggeris, L1 = Bahasa Malaysia, dua subtitle = L1 + L2 dan tiada sarikata). Instrumen yang digunakan adalah ujian kosa kata, ujian kefahaman dan soal selidik untuk mengenal pasti persepsi mereka tentang sarikata. Hasil kajian menunjukkan keadaan sarikata dan tahap kecakapan bahasa yang berbeza, boleh memberi kesan yang berbeza terhadap perbendaharaan kata dan pemahaman pelajar.

Kata kunci: Perbendaharaan kata, Pemahaman, Sari kata, Bahasa kedua, Strategi Pembelajaran

ABSTRACT

Vocabulary is an essential means of interchanging ideas and of acquiring new experiences. The lack of knowledge in vocabularies will cause the English speakers to have less comprehension in

the language. Audiovisual materials enhanced with subtitle are powerful pedagogical tools that are believed to make comprehension easier. This study investigates the most effective subtitle condition in facilitating vocabulary acquisition and comprehension among ESL speakers in Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia, Bangi. This study is also intended to find out whether the students perform differently, depending on their proficiency level and to determine the perception of the use of subtitles for language learning. 10 undergraduate students with different proficiency level based on their MUET scores were used for this study. Participants were asked to watch four videos from an American sitcom titled "How I Met Your Mother" with each given different subtitling conditions (L2 = English subtitles, L1 = Bahasa Malaysia, dual subtitling = L1 + L2 and no subtitle). The instruments used are vocabulary tests, comprehension tests and lastly, a questionnaire to identify their perceptions on subtitling. The results of the study may show different subtitle conditions and proficiency level have different effects on students' vocabulary and comprehension.

Keywords: Vocabulary, Comprehension, Subtitle, Second Language, Learning Strategies

1. Introduction

Language is the main tool used for communication by people all over the world. The English language is one of the examples of languages and it is also one of the most spoken languages in the world until today. Graddol's study (2000) suggests that in the year 2000 there were about a billion English learners, but a decade later the numbers doubled. English is the L2 language that Malaysians communicate. However, many still face problems incomprehension of the language, and some still have the anxiety to speak the language well. Meanwhile, in classrooms, video materials have made their way into English second language classrooms to facilitate language learning. ESL learners can found more opportunities to use these audio-visual materials as an effective tool in the process of learning the English language (Shyamlee, 2012). Audiovisual materials enhanced with captions are powerful pedagogical tools that are believed to help improve L2 listening and reading comprehension skills (Borras & Lafayette, 1994; Danan, 2004; Garza, 1991; Markham & Peter, 2003). With the technology of subtitling in movies, comprehension is made easier with the aid of text with the combination of sound and image. Viewers are quite motivated to understand what is shown and said on television when the captions are provided (Danna, 2004). According to Zanon (2006), indicates that subtitles might be distinguished to the following types: 1. Bi-modal subtitling (English dialogues to English subtitles). 2. Standard subtitling (English dialogues to learners' mother tongue language). 3. Reversed subtitling (dialogues form learners mother tongue language with English subtitles).

1.1 Problem Statement

One way to become sufficient or better user of English Language is to learn more vocabulary. In this way, the speakers can communicate better as they have a wider knowledge of the choices of words. With the lack of knowledge in vocabularies, students will face problems in communicating in the language. Allias (1997) discussed that Malaysians needs to have better proficiency in the English language, which he says "mere knowledge of the language and linguistic competence was seen as being inadequate for a nation fast developing and playing a part in the international trade". Allias (1997) even suggest that language bestows prestige and guarantees a job and social as well as occupational ability for Malaysians. This shows that the

importance of having good proficiency is important for Malaysians as it does not only involve in business but it is also associated with the daily lives of Malaysians in the century. Sedau (2004) suggests that decline standard of English is worrying and the way to prevent this problem is to introduce the learning of vocabularies in classes.

This is important as, in Malaysia, students rarely learn new vocabularies due to several factors. According to Allen (1983) in the twentieth-century teachers have started to neglect in teaching vocabulary in the English program and they are more focused on the topics such as pronunciation and grammar. Moreover, when they are taught with the proper knowledge on vocabularies most students will find it boring and they will be less interested due to the use of traditional way of teaching. To overcome this problem, the usage of movies in the classroom has been implemented. The reason for this is, there are a lot of new vocabularies that can be found in English movies and be learning through audio-visual is found more interesting for students compared to reading books or just listening in class. "Combining text with visuals is more effective in facilitating vocabulary learning than providing only definitions of words" (Akbulut, 2007).

Vocabularies and comprehension is something that goes hand in hand. The lack of knowledge in vocabularies will cause the English speakers to have less comprehension in the language. Nagy (1988) reported that "the obviousness of the need and the strong relationship between vocabulary and comprehension invite an overly simplistic response: if we simply teach students more words, they will understand text better". This explains that with the expansion of vocabularies will increase the comprehension of the English language speaker. This study is focused on how subtitle will facilitate the process of English language learning in the classroom, resulting in the increasing the knowledge of vocabularies resulting them into better comprehension ability.

1.2 Objective

The purpose of this research is to study the efficiency of subtitles as a facilitator of English language in vocabulary and comprehension learning amongst ESL speakers.

1. To determine the most effective subtitle condition in facilitating vocabulary acquisition and comprehension among ESL speakers in UKM Bangi.
2. To investigate whether the students perform differently depending on their proficiency level among ESL speakers in UKM Bangi.
3. To identify the perception of the use of subtitles among ESL speakers in UKM Bangi.

1.3 Research Questions

Based on the problems and purposes stated in the previous sections, here are the research questions that are attempted to address in the study:

1. What is the most effective subtitle condition on students' vocabulary learning?
2. What is the most effective subtitle condition on students' comprehension?
3. Will students perform differently depending on their proficiency level?
4. What is students' general perception towards the four subtitle conditions?

1.4 Significance of the Study

The purpose of this research is to study the efficiency of subtitles as a facilitator of English language in vocabulary and comprehension learning amongst ESL speakers. The focus of this

research is to study the effectiveness of using subtitles to promote vocabulary acquisition and comprehension. It is hope of the researcher that through this research, teachers, and students will understand that the combination of text in audio-visual learning aids is a method for language learning. By the extent of the latter statement, the use of subtitles in ESL classrooms should be practiced more often in English classes in Malaysia in order to increase the level of proficiency and language ability of ESL speakers in Malaysia. In this era, proficiency of English is important in Malaysia. A report by Hanapiah (2004) suggests that English is the language of progress and development. This shows that in order for students in Malaysia to become successful it is important for them to have good English language abilities.

2. Literature Review

2.1. Second Language Acquisition

Saville-Troike (2006) defines second language acquisition (SLA) as “both the study of individuals and groups who are learning a language subsequent to learning their first one as young children”. The first language that is learned by children at their young age is what is called the first language (L1). The parents are usually the reason behind the child’s first language acquisition. Second language does not only refer to the language that is learned by the child after the first language, but it is all the language that is learned after acquiring their first one. (Saville-Troike, 2006). Saville-Troike (2006) also suggests that there are differences between informal and formal L2 learning. Informal learning happens in naturalistic contexts and formal learning is where it is taught in a classroom. The method of learning that issued for these study, will be using both ways of learning. This is because learning through videos and subtitles is something that happens outside and inside the classroom.

2.2 Grammar and Vocabulary

In order for learners to produce a sentence correctly, the knowledge of vocabulary and grammar is needed this because these aspects of the English language is the fundamental of the language. Research has shown that the grammar constructions during we speak has a lot of differences when it is used when we write (Nation, 2011). Nation (2011) suggested this is because in speech it is usually more casual than speaking with the differences of the amount of coordinated, noun and adverbial phrases.

Meanwhile, the in written language it is largely phrasal with many complex nouns. Therefore, in Nation (2011) interpretation, this means that the learning of written language would not be adequate to the learning of spoken language, due to the differences of grammatical models. Therefore, in teaching, teachers should also give focus on clausal rather than phrasal constructions. (Nation, 2011). This means that film would give the same value in learning the language as in videos, films, and movies the use of informal spoken language is used widely than formal language. There are several issues that can be seen in language teaching. One of the issues is the priority of certain areas, particularly grammar and vocabulary. While, there has been a large focus on the importance of grammar, the importance of vocabulary as the main component in language proficiency has also perceived as being important (Ur, 2011). To communicate efficiently, vocabulary will be seen as the most important part. Thus, vocabulary plays a huge role, this is because in having a large knowledge of words will make someone is able to communicate better in delivering their thoughts and meanings.

For the purpose of this study, vocabulary will be an important variable in the investigation of language learning through videos. Nation and Webb (2011) have listed five conditions in vocabulary learning. The first condition is motivation. Motivation is an important aspect of every learning. Even to watch a video, it has to have motivation in the activity itself, due to the different genres. In classrooms, watching visual-aid items may have better motivation for the students because it will be different from the students' ordinary days at school which consists of reading and listening to their teacher. However, teachers feel that with the use of videos in a classroom the students who view would have a different intention than learning, which could be only for recreational activity. This shows the differences in the student's attitude. Some students inside the classroom will become more unmotivated when they hear there will be learning, or any work that goes with the video but, some it will become motivating as it is a different method. The second condition is repetition. This is implied to meetings of new words even in different circumstances. If a video is on a specific topic, some words are better to be repeated inside the video in order to help the learning process. The third condition that is suggested by Nation and Webb (2011) is the four strands – four important concepts of acquisition. In this condition input and output, and learning and development are central in interaction with each other. The fourth condition that is suggested by Nation and Webb is thoughtful processing. This means that the students should be more aware of their situation or during watching a video with picking up new strategies to pick up and learn new vocabularies. The last condition is called as the meaningful relationship. This means, to create a relationship between words. This could help the students in their understanding and meaning of the words with a different context.

2.3 *Benefits of subtitle in SLA*

In the study to find the benefits of subtitle in language learning Vanderplank (1988) was one of the earliest. In his research Vanderplank (1988), there were fifteen English language learners that were in the level of high-intermediate in the language. They all were instructed to watch BBC programs with teletext subtitles and were asked to give their feedback on their experience with the experiment. The participants reported that the subtitles were beneficial to their language development and that 'they were able to developed strategies and techniques for using sub-titles flexibly and according to need'. In the early comments of Vanderplank (1988) he suggested that subtitles are more beneficial to the English learners with post-intermediate-level learners as it provides a more comprehensible input compared to learners with low-level. The results also 'indicated that sub-titles promote a low affective filter, encourage conscious language learning in "literate" learners, and, paradoxically, release spare language-processing capacity' (Vanderplank, 1988). However, Vanderplank (1990) carried out a further research in order to explore the benefits and limitation of subtitle as a tool for language learning. Based from his previous research, Vanderplank (1990) and many others said what they found is that subtitles do not act as a distraction learning but it actually acts as an aid for language learning; 'the double modal input appears to enhance comprehension better than simple script or sound'. Next, he even reported more students were paying more attention and used the note-taking method and this will create higher level of users of the English language. Danan (2004) seems to agree with the point made by suggesting in his research that the "learners needed to be trained to develop active viewing strategies for an efficient use of captioned and subtitles material". This shows that he had the

same view with Vanderplank's (1990) in the methods to get the learners to become more engaged to the material.

2.4 *Views on Subtitling*

A study on Same Language Subtitling (SLS) by Gunderson, Odo and D'Silva (2011) has been done and found success in the place of rural India. It was said that SLS was beneficial in offering literacy for the learners even in L2 literacy (L2L), this is because it helped them in reading. SLS is an easy and powerful technique for language development. Even though this report is not from a place in the urban area, it is still fascinating as it shows the language gaining knowledge as a critical problem in all degrees of society. Bird and Williams' (2002) focused on the effect of mastering spoken phrases also with lengthy phrases for implicit and express memory and it was said that orthographic would help. The participants of the test came from a western and eastern background. Therefore, it showed that the technique is beneficial for anyone from different backgrounds. For the second language learning the same language subtitle that is provided for hearing impaired people, it will still be beneficial for the learning process (Bird and Williams',2002)

According to Danan (2004) there were several problems that could be seen with subtitling as an example in the United States subtitle were viewed as a tool that encourages the learners to give their attention on the subtitle and took away their attention from the spoken words and sometimes resulting into problems of laziness and cheating among learners. But Danan (2004) states in the European area, it was reported that the students felt the subtitles has let them learn English from the exposure of subtitles in their daily American films and television programs. Even with the existence of subtitles in text form and it became an automatic behaviour for the audience to read them, it does not prevent any process from listening to the soundtrack (Danan, 2004). Guillory (1998) reported there is even weakness of subtitling and captions when it comes to materials that have an advanced level. This is due to the reason of the speech were too fast and difficulty of the vocabulary was too advanced, therefore, the subtitle and captions could not compensate them. However, Danan (2004) argued that subtitle and captions can still be beneficial in the process of comprehension, recognition of words and vocabulary building.

3. **Methodology**

For this research, there are two different methods used to find out the results: experiment and questionnaire survey. According to Dornyei (2007), there are several purposes in carrying out a mixed method approach in a research, it helps the researcher to investigate complex issues in education matter and give more information to the researcher. This will give the researcher more opportunity to draw better conclusions. Moreover, carrying out more than one method in research increases the validity of the result of the research due to the results combined. In relation to the reason of using qualitative data analysis method for this research, Dornyei points out that "...Including a qualitative phase to explore the nature of such processes is a natural and potentially highly fruitful design that can greatly enhance the study's validity" (Dornyei, 2007).

3.1 *Study Sample*

A total of 10 undergraduates at Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia agreed to take part in this study. All the participants are around the age of 19 to 25 years old. The native language that is

spoken by them is Bahasa Malaysia and the second language being English. Some even communicate in both languages at home. All the students have knowledge of the English language, as to enter the university in Malaysia it was compulsory sitting for Malaysian University English Test (MUET). Most of the respondents have been taught English since at home, and the latest in primary school. The Malaysian educational system is a little traditional. The traditional features of the system is focusing on firstly, it is an examination-oriented assessment. Secondly, grammatical knowledge of language predominates classroom instruction and lastly, is the use of textbook is heavily depended as a teaching material. Next, for interview, a total of 5 respondents have been chosen after the test. The respondents are Adzrul(Band 5), Ainin (Band 4), Fayyadh (Band 3), Firdaus (Band 3) and Naqib (Band 2).

3.2 *Materials*

Questionnaire

The questionnaire is held in order to obtain a general overview of the participant's information. All the participants were asked to answered questions including, gender, age, years of learning L2 English, MUET test score, and preference to English language videos.

Video Clips

The four video clips that were selected for this researched came from the same TV series “How I Met Your Mother”. The stories were revolved around Ted and his group of friends who lived in Manhattan, New York. As a framing device, Ted, in the year 2030 is retelling the story of how he met his wife to his son and daughter. As Krashen (1982) has suggested that low anxiety is necessary for acquisition to occur, I choose to use a genre that is more appealing to the audience which will help them to focus their attention, which learning will be improved. The four video clips were given different subtitling conditioned which are the L1 subtitle, L2 subtitle, L1+L2 subtitle and no subtitle. To ensure the difficulty level of the videos equal, I’ve chosen all the videos from the same TV series. Moreover, all the video clips were around 3 to 5 minutes long was to make sure the participants would understand the whole context of the video. However, the four video clips have an independent plotting of the story. This is in order, for the participants possible to answer the test after watching each video clips. The videos are shown to the participants according to Video 1 (English subtitle), Video 2 (Bahasa Malaysia subtitle), Video 3 (Dual subtitle / English and Bahasa Malaysia) and Video 4 (no subtitle). Each video is shown on the projector in front of the screen and it could only be viewed once and without a pause.

Vocabulary Test

There is one vocabulary test for each video clip that was shown making four tests in total. Each vocabulary test consisted of only 5 sentences with one underlined word in each. The participants answered the vocabulary test right after watching one video clip. This is to make sure all the test will be fair to the video clips. In the test, the participants will be asked to give the correct English or Bahasa Malaysia synonym to the word that is underlined in the sentence. The sentence given will be the sentence that is exactly appeared in the video clip. This is to give the students better ability to understand the context of the word. Vocabulary tests. Exact translations or synonyms received full credit (1 point). Incorrect translations were given no credit (0 points). Half credit (0.5 points) was given if students were partially correct about the answer.

Comprehension tests

There is one listening comprehension test for each clip being four tests in total. Each comprehension test, consists of 5 questions. The participants will be answering the comprehension test after they are done answering the vocabulary test. To make sure the participant understand the questions of the tests, the questions are written in two language which English is the main language and Malay language. The reason behind this is the test is more concerned with student's comprehension of subtitles. To get better results and validity the students need to feel comfortable about the tests. Therefore, they can choose to answer the questions either in English or Bahasa Malaysia. Comprehension tests. For the scoring of the comprehension tests, each idea unit mentioned in the summary received full credit (1 point). If the answer was inaccurate or partially correct, students received 0.5 points. If the answer was incorrect, they received 0 points.

Interview

5 respondents will be picked by random after the study for an interview to identify their general perception on subtitling. A voice recorder is prepared to record the interview and the results of the interview will be tabulated in a table.

Procedure

The study took place in a computer lab in Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia (UKM) with a screen and projector equipped. The students shall be given a background survey to identify their proficiency level and other demographic details of the respondents. In the beginning, the experiment all the participants were given numbers and informed about the procedure of the test. Students then watched the clips together on the screen. To avoid any special focus on subtitles, they were not informed that they would watch four clips in different subtitled conditioned. After watching each video clip, students immediately did a test, which compromised of vocabulary test and comprehension test. To avoid students paying special attention to the vocabulary words being tested, they were not given the test paper prior to watching the clips. After they watched the four clips and finishing the four tests, 5 respondents were picked randomly and were interviewed to identify their perception about their general preference towards the three conditions of subtitled (and not subtitled). To have students better understand what conditions of subtitles are more suitable and helpful for them, the perception interview was held after they had already watched the videos and done the tests. The time for the experiment is around an hour in total.

Data Analysis

To measure the most effective subtitled condition for ESL speakers, which is to find out the result of vocabulary acquisition and comprehension of the participants, the score for each question is added and totaled. After all the scores have been totaled, it is tabulated inside a table. Firstly, the data is compared between the highest and lowest total scores from each test. This is to identify which test with different subtitling conditions did better. Next, the respondents' scores will be interpreted to find out which subtitle is the most efficient for the students and the least. Proficiency level of the students will also be compared as variable with the total scores of test and each respondent to find out if subtitling works differently with different subtitling conditions. In the discussion the results are compared to identify subtitle condition is more

effective than another. The interview data are analyzed to find out the patterns of perceptions of the respondents. Their answers will be compared with their proficiency level to investigate does the perception differ between proficiency levels.

4. Findings

4.1 Respondents' Profile

Table 1 shows the breakdown of respondents from students in Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia (UKM) Bangi area based on their gender.

TABLE 1: Respondent demography based on gender

GENDER	FREQUENCY (people)
Male	7
Female	3

Respondents in this study consist of 10 students from Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia (UKM) Bangi. The respondents of this study were undergraduates aged 19 to 25 years old from variety of faculties in UKM. 7 people of the respondents are male respondents and 3 people are female respondents.

Table 2 shows the breakdown of respondents from students in Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia (UKM) Bangi area based on their MUET scores achieved by each individual.

TABLE 2: Respondent demography based on MUET scores.

MUET SCORE	FREQUENCY (people)	PERCENTAGE (%)
Band 1	0	0
Band 2	1	10
Band 3	4	40
Band 4	3	30
Band 5	2	20
Band 6	0	0

10% (1 person) of the respondents acquired Band 2, 20% (2 people) acquired Band 5, 30% (3 people) acquired Band 4 and the highest is Band 3 respondents which is 40% (4 people). Furthermore, 5 of the respondents achieved Band 4 – 6 and the others achieved Band 2 – 3. The amount of respondents of the two categories were picked equal, as this will provide better and balanced results.

4.2 What is the most effective subtitle condition on students' vocabulary learning?

Section A of the test consist of 4 vocabulary test with 5 questions for each test. The highest total score for the vocabulary test is Test 2 which is 44 points (88%). Meanwhile, the lowest total

score for vocabulary test is Test 3 with 32.5 points (65%). The highest total score obtained is by respondent 6 with a total of 20 points (100%). The second lowest are respondent 7 and 9 with 19 points respectively (95%) with having the lowest point on Test 3. The lowest total score for vocabulary test is respondent 2 with 8.5 points (21.25%) having the highest point on Test 2 and Test 4 with 3 points (60%) respectively and lowest point on Test 1 with 0.5 points (10%).

TABLE 3: Vocabulary Test Results

Respondent	Video 1 (English subtitle)	Video 2 (Bahasa Malaysia subtitle)	Video 3 (Dual subtitle)	Video 4 (No subtitle)	Total scores
1	1	4	1.5	3	9.5
2	0.5	3	2	3	8.5
3	4	5	4	4	17
4	2	4	2	4	12
5	2	4	2	4	12
6	5	5	5	5	20
7	5	5	4	5	19
8	3.5	4	4	4	15.5
9	5	5	4	5	19
10	5	5	4	4	18

Section A	Test 1	Test 2	Test 3	Test 4
Total Scores	33	44	32.5	41

4.3 What is the most effective subtitle condition on students' comprehension?

Section B of the test consist of 4 comprehension test with 5 questions for each test. The highest total score for comprehension test is Test 1 which is 40 points (80%) and the lowest total score is Test 2 with 26 points (52%). The highest total score obtained is by respondent 6 and 7 with 19 points (95%). Respondent 6 had the lowest points in Test 2 with 4 points (80%) and respondent had the lowest points in Test 4 with 4 points (80%). Furthermore, the lowest total score was obtained by respondent 1 with 6 points (30%) with having the lowest point on Test 2 with 0 points (0%).

TABLE 4: Comprehension Test Results

Respondent	Video 1 (English subtitle)	Video 2 (Bahasa Malaysia subtitle)	Video 3 (Dual subtitle)	Video 4 (No subtitle)	Total scores
1	2.5	0	2.5	1	6
2	2.5	2	3	0	7.5
3	5	2	4	4.5	15.5
4	3	1.5	3	1.5	9
5	3	1.5	3	1.5	9
6	5	4	5	5	19
7	5	5	5	4	19
8	4.5	2	4	3.5	14
9	5	4	5	3.5	17.5
10	4.5	4	5	5	18.5
Section B	Test 1	Test 2	Test 3	Test 4	
Total Scores	40	26	39.5	29.5	

4.4 Will students perform differently depending on their proficiency level?

The highest score is obtained by respondent 6 with 39 points (97.5%) with obtaining a Band 5 for MUET. The lowest score is respondent 1 with 15.5 points (38.75%). Respondent 1 scores a Band 2 for MUET. The average scores for Band 5 respondents is 38.5 points (96.25%), Band 4 respondents with 34.2 points (85.42%), Band 3 respondents with an average of 22.6 points (56.56%) and the average for a Band 2 student is 15.5 points (38.75%). A correlation has been done to find out the relation between the total scores and proficiency level of the respondents. A high correlation was reported between the variables of respondents' proficiency level and total scores (0.85931).

TABLE 5. Overall results

Respondent	MUET (Band)	Video 1 (English subtitle)	Video 2 (Bahasa Malaysia subtitle)	Video 3 (Dual subtitle)	Video 4 (No subtitle)	Total scores
1	2	3.5	4	4	4	15.5
2	3	3	5	5	3	16
3	3	9	7	8	8.5	32.5
4	3	5	5.5	5	5.5	21
5	3	5	5.5	5	5.5	21
6	5	10	9	10	10	39
7	5	10	10	9	9	38
8	4	8	6	8	7.5	29.5
9	4	10	9	9	8.5	36.5
10	4	9.5	9	9	9	36.5

	Total Scores
Proficiency Level	0.85931

4.5 *What are students' general perception towards the four subtitle conditions?*

A total of 6 questions were asked to the 5 respondents were interviewed to found out their perceptions on the subtitling study. All the interviews were done on a one-to-one basis as this will give each respondent more opportunity to spoke and answer honestly. The first question of the interview was “What do you think of the subtitled TV series you have watched just now?” Ainin and Naqib replied;

I feel like the English subtitle is okay.

The first theme that could be observed from the answers is the respondents feel the English subtitle was helpful. Fayyadh added;

Subtitles has always been a technique for me to improve my English proficiency.

However, a few respondents said Bahasa Malaysia and dual subtitles are less helpful as usually Bahasa Malaysia was found to have inaccurate translations from the original language Ainin and Adzrul explained;

The Bahasa Malaysia is not preferable.

Most of L2 translated subtitles always face the same problems which is the translation will not be accurate.

Furthermore, Naqib even shared the same opinion with the other two respondents;

The Bahasa Malaysia might have inaccurate translations and the dual subtitle is messy and the no subtitle video is a little hard to understand

Next, to find out the respondents personal preference on subtitling when watching American TV series at home, they were asked “When watching an American TV series at home, which subtitle would you prefer?” All the respondents prefer the use of English subtitles, Adzrul and Naqib explains;

I would prefer the use of English subtitles because it would be better for my understanding as the voices are in line with the subtitles.

English, because the words that are said are the same as the subtitle which makes understanding easier.

However, Ainin and Firdaus explains why they choose English subtitles rather than Bahasa Malaysia or dual subtitles as their preferred subtitle while watching American TV series at home;

English, most subtitles in Bahasa Malaysia are often direct translated, so it is not accurate sometimes to the context.

English, because the way it is delivered because when it is in Bahasa Malaysia it would be a little inaccurate.

Thirdly, the respondents were asked “If watching a movie in an English class, which one do you think is more helpful for the improvement of your vocabulary acquisition and comprehension ability?”. The respondents had different opinions on the matter, Firdaus and Adzrul feel the English would be best. Adzrul explains;

Sometimes it is hard to listen to what is being said while in a packed classroom.

Therefore English subtitles would be the best for understanding the content.

On the other hand, Ainin and Fayyadh feels Bahasa Malaysia would be the option for subtitling in a classroom, both clarified;

In classrooms there might be people who have low proficiency in English, it would be easier for everyone to learn and understand.

Next, all the respondents were asked “Did the subtitles help you in understanding the video and complete the test?” and all of them agreed that subtitling had helped them in completing the test. However, they were asked which subtitle helped them the best in completing the test, Adzrul, Naqib, Fayyadh and Firdaus agreed English subtitle helped them the most. Furthermore, Ainin felt dual subtitle helped her the most in completing the test. Fifthly, the respondents were asked on their opinion on the series without subtitling, Ainin, Naqib, Fayyadh and Adzrul did not preferred the video without the subtitle. Ainin explains;

People who have low command in English would have trouble understanding the video.

Lastly, to end the interview the respondents were all asked “In your opinion, does subtitling helps language learning?” and all the respondents shared the same opinions that subtitling is a method to facilitate language learning. Naqib and Firdaus reasons;

We could learn new vocabularies and learn pronunciation.

Ainin and Adzrul even gave their reasons on why they feel subtitling helps language learning;

Subtitle can help as a reference so others can learn by comparing it to their first language.

Subtitles helps people in understanding better especially with different language subtitles.

5. Discussion

The first research question of this study was to find out what was the most effective subtitle condition that could facilitate students’ vocabulary learning. All the videos were given different subtitling treatment Video 1 (English subtitle), Video 2 (Bahasa Malaysia subtitle), Video 3 (Dual subtitle / English and Bahasa Malaysia). The results show Test 2 result had the highest score with 44 points (88%) which shows Bahasa Malaysia subtitling is the most effective subtitling condition for vocabulary learning. This could be supported with the lowest total score for vocabulary test, is respondent 2 with 8.5 points (21.25%) having the highest point on Test 2 and Test 4 with 3 points (60%). Majority of Malaysian students speaks in their native language which is Bahasa Malaysia. Therefore, as ESL speakers they tend to code switch highly from L1 to L2 between words in a conversation to help them deliver their message. Not only that, this could be a reason from ESL speakers culture relying highly in dual language learning since early education. However, this result contradicts to past research of Wafa (2015) in finding the effect of subtitle of the two different subtitling group for vocabulary learning. The research revealed English subtitles group (160 differences) obtained a higher degree of improvement compared to the Malay subtitles group (101 differences).

Next, this study aims to identify the most effective subtitle condition in facilitating students’ comprehension. With the same treatment of videos for the test, the results displayed English subtitling is the most effective subtitling condition in facilitating comprehension among students with Test 1 obtaining 40 points (80%). The highest total score from the respondents, two of them obtained full 5 points (100%) on Test 1. Furthermore, respondent 1 with the lowest total score of 6 points (30%) scored highest on Test 1, collecting 2.5 points (50%). The use of English speaking videos and addition of English subtitle it creates a synchronized pattern of

speech in line with the text provided in the subtitle. The viewers could hear and read the dialogue, impacting their comprehension ability as they can understand the whole context of the video better. This illustrates, to have the students to have the best results in their comprehension ability it is best to use subtitle with the same language as the language spoken in the video (SLS). However, in this study, English subtitle is the most efficient subtitling condition in facilitating the students' comprehension ability. The results of this study are aligned with the past research Saed et. al (2016) showing that the group of students with English subtitling treatment performed better in the comprehension test than the group with native language subtitling and no subtitling.

Lastly, the final research question of the study is to find out the students' general perception towards the four subtitle conditions. All the respondents with different proficiency level preferred English subtitles in the test at even when watching American TV series at home. Some feel that Bahasa Malaysia subtitles faces the problem of inaccurate translations while dual subtitle had issues where it could be too distracting for the viewers until it takes their focus away from the video itself. Respondents choose English subtitles from the other subtitling conditions is because it helped them the most in their understanding. A respondent added that he uses English subtitle to learn the English language and improve his proficiency. Next, there were a lot of different opinions in finding out which subtitle condition would be best in watching videos in classrooms. The reason behind this is that the norm of Malaysian students across Malaysia have different proficiencies due to numerous factors such as level of education, geographic location, technologies, friends, families and many more. Therefore, some feel that Bahasa Malaysia would be the best option as having good proficiency in the language is the norm of most Malaysians. However, some respondents suggested dual subtitling would be the best option in classrooms as Malaysia is made up from different ethnics, and some even speaks English, Chinese, Tamil or other languages on a daily basis. Having dual subtitling will help students who prefer subtitles in English as well as helping lower proficiency students in English to learn better, because of the availability of subtitles in the native language. In addition, all the respondents would prefer the use of subtitling in videos as they feel without subtitle it would be more difficult for their understanding even for higher proficiency respondents. Reflecting on the vocabulary and comprehension test results test with no subtitling test was placed second and third. This suggests that even without subtitling it has its benefits such as giving audience less thing to focus on. However, to obtain the best result in language learning for vocabulary and comprehension it is preferred to use subtitles as a facilitator as agreed by all the respondents interviewed. It helped the students in improving the pronunciation of words by reading the subtitle or even comparing it to the first language.

6. Conclusion

According to the results of the study, the students scored better with the use of subtitles in video than watching video without subtitles. This explains that the use of subtitle in videos can aid vocabulary learning and comprehension among students. This was in line with previous studies which suggested the positive effects of subtitled videos in language learning (Brett, 1995; Chai & Erlam, 2008; Danan, 2004; Low & Chia-Tzu, 2012; Markham & Peter, 2003; Park, 1994; Taylor, 2005, Winke et al., 2010). Most of the studies was done to identify the differences of subtitling between L1 and L2 language. In this study the use of L1 subtitling (Bahasa Malaysia), L2 (English) and dual subtitling (Bahasa Malaysia and English) has been carried out. The results

illustrated that each subtitles have different effectiveness on language learning based on the topic learned. This study found that the best subtitling to learn vocabularies is L1 subtitle. This result of this is inconsistent with Markham and Peter (2003), whose students who watched videos with L2 English outperformed those with L1 Spanish subtitles. This due to the reason of different language being investigated in the studies.

Next, the factor of having the words spoken by the actor in L2 translated in subtitle L1 helped the students to understand the meaning of the words better. The comprehension tests results are not the same as the vocabulary tests, which suggest that students' understanding of the video may not solely depend on the vocabulary level of the video. Comprehension test results indicated the students performed best in English subtitle than L1 subtitle, dual subtitle and no subtitle. This is in line with Lwo and Chia-Tzu Lin (2012) in that L2 English elicited better test scores than no subtitles. However, no subtitling scored a few points more than L1 subtitling with the lowest score for student's comprehension tests. The reason behind this is probably because the students' faces problem of inaccurate translations with Bahasa Malaysia subtitles which may result in confusion. Based on Vygotsky's Zone of Proximal Development (1980), subtitles serve as the mediation part of the theory in which "learner can do with help." The viewers of the video will be able obtain learners hints which is necessary in understanding English from the videos. Thus, helping them in performing better beyond their current abilities.

Subtitling is also a great tool for students' self-learning. With the use of subtitle in videos they can adjust which subtitling condition is best for their understanding and difficulty of the video, proficiency level, and objectives. The results also illustrate that English subtitle is preferred with the students while watching at home. This is because the students were able to improve their proficiency in the language with the use of subtitle. They were able to replicate the sounds for pronunciation, learn new vocabularies and even look at the discourse patterns of speeches. According to Paivio (1991), subtitles help language learners make connections between auditory and visual input. This is also in line with the redundancy principle in Cognitive Theory of Multimedia Learning. According to Clark and Mayer (2011), the use of visual text in learning situations is one of the situations where the text will not become too redundant, it actually aids the understanding ability of the students.

In classrooms it was shown to use Bahasa Malaysia or dual subtitling as the subtitling condition according to the students. As, dual subtitles can build students' confidence, help them learn new words and phrases, allow them to check comprehension, and help them develop their interests in language learning. But one of the respondent suggested that dual subtitling face issues such as being too distracting for viewing which is in line with Taylor (2005) that L2 Spanish beginners found the captions distracting and had trouble paying attention to the subtitled videos in multi-media settings. On the other hand, vocabulary and comprehension test results illustrates no subtitling test was placed second and third. This suggests that no subtitling has its benefits such as giving audience less thing to focus on, training their listening skills, and improve listening skills. In contrary, the interview showed the students prefer the use of subtitle for watching videos in self-language learning or in classrooms. In a nutshell, the use of subtitling as a tool for language learning should be recognized by students and teachers. This is to create students with better proficiency in the English language as it will be beneficial for the students and the development of the society in Malaysia

References

- Allen, V. F. (1983). *Techniques in Teaching Vocabulary*. Oxford University Press, 200 Madison Ave., New York, NY 10016 (ISBN 0-19-434130-5)
- Alias Mohammad Yatim. (1997). *200 Years on: English in the Malaysian Education system*. In Marshallsay, Zaniah (Ed.). *Educational Challenges in Malaysia: Advances and Prospects*. Proceedings of the Conference Organized by the Centre of Malaysian Studies, 11 April 1996, Clayton, Australia, Monash Asia Institute.
- Amin Saed, Arash Yazdani, Mohsen Askary (2016). *Film Subtitles and Listening Comprehension Ability of Intermediate EFL Learners*. International Journal of Applied Linguistics and Translation. Vol. 2, No. 3, 2016, pp. 29-32. doi: 10.11648/j.ijalt.20160203.12
- Akbulut, Y. (2007). *Effects of multimedia annotations on incidental vocabulary learning and reading comprehension of advanced learners of English as a foreign language*. Instructional Science, 35(6), 499-517.
- Bird, S. A. & Williams, J. N. (2002). *The Effect of Bimodal Input on Implicit and Explicit Memory: An Investigation into the Benefits of Within-Language Subtitling*. Applied Psycholinguistics, 23(4), 509-533. doi: 10.1017/S0142716402004022
- Borrás, I., & Lafayette, R. C. (1994). *Effects of multimedia courseware subtitling on the speaking performance of college students of French*. Modern Language Journal, 78(1), 61-75. <http://dx.doi.org/10.2307/329253>
- Brett, P. (1995). *Multimedia for listening comprehension: The design of a multimedia-based resource for developing listening skills*. System, 23(1), 77-85.
- Chai, J., & Erlam, R. (2008). *The Effect and the Influence of the Use of Video and Captions on Second Language Learning*. New Zealand Studies in Applied Linguistics, 14(2), 25.
- Clark, R. C., & Mayer, R. E. (2011). *E-Learning and the science of instruction: Proven guidelines for consumers and designers of multimedia learning (3rd edition)*. San Francisco, CA: John Wiley & Sons.
- Danan, M. (2004). *Captioning and Subtitling: Undervalued Language Learning Strategies*. Meta: Translators' Journal, 49(1), 67-77. doi: 10.7202/009021ar
- Dörnyei, Z. (2007). *Research methods in applied linguistics: Quantitative, qualitative, and mixed methodologies*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Garza, T. J. (1991). *Evaluating the Use of Captioned Video Materials in Advanced Foreign Language Learning* (3rd ed., Vol. 24). American Council on the Teaching of Foreign Languages. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1944-9720.1991.tb00469.x>
- Graddol, D. (2000). *The future of English: A guide to forecasting the popularity of the English language in the 21st century*. London: The British Council.
- Guillroy, H.G. (1998). *The effects of keyword captions to authentic French video on learner comprehension*. Calico Journal, 15(1/3), 89-108
- Gunderson, L & Odo, Dennis & D'Silva, R. (2011). *Second language literacy*. Handbook of research in second language teaching and learning. 2. 472-487.
- Hanapiah, M. F. (2004). *English Language And The Language Of Development: A Malaysia Perspective*. Jurnal kemanusiaan, 2(1).
- Lwo, L., & Chia-Tzu Lin, M. (2012). *The effects of captions in teenagers' multimedia L2 learning*. ReCALL, 24(02), 188-208. Markham, P., & Peter, L. (2003). *The influence of*

- English language and Spanish language captions on foreign language Listening / reading comprehension.* Journal of Educational Technology Systems, 31(3), 331-341.
- Nagy, W. E. (1988). *Vocabulary instruction and reading comprehension.* Center for the Study of Reading Technical Report; no.431.
- Nation, I.S.P. & Webb, S. (2011). *Content-Based Instruction and Vocabulary Learning.* In E.Hinkel (ed.), *Handbook of Research in Second Language Teaching and Learning*, Volume II. (pp. 631-644), London: Routledge
- Nation, I.S.P. (2011). *Second Language Speaking.* In E. Hinkel (ed.), *Handbook of Research in Second Language Teaching and Learning*, Volume II. (pp. 444-454), London: Routledge
- Omar, Wafa. (2015). *The effects of watching English and Malay subtitled English movie on ESL students' English vocabulary / Wafa Omar.* Masters thesis, Universiti Teknologi MARA.
- Paivio, A. (1991). *Dual coding theory: retrospect and current status.* *Canadian Journal of Psychology/Revue canadienne de psychologie*, 45(3), 255.
- Parks, C. (1994). *Closed Captioned TV: A Resource for ESL Literacy Education.* *ERIC Digest. National Clearinghouse for ESL Literacy Education*
- Taylor, G. (2005). *Perceived processing strategies of students watching captioned video.* *Foreign Language Annals*, 38(3), 422-427.
- Winke, P., Gass, S., & Sydorenko, T. (2010). *The effects of captioning videos used for foreign language listening activities.* *Language Learning & Technology*, 14(1), 65-86.
- Saville-Troike, M. (2006). *Introducing Second Language Acquisition.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- Sedau, E. A. (2004). *Exploring Vocabulary Difficulty in English Literature Classroom and Solutions: an Action Research* (Doctoral dissertation, Universiti Malaysia Sarawak).
- Solanki D. Shyamlee and M Phil. (2012). *Use of Technology in English Language Teaching and Learning: An Analysis.* International Conference on Language, Medias and Culture IPEDR vol.33 (2012) © (2012) IACSIT Press, Singapore.
- Vanderplank, R. (1988). *The value of teletext sub-titles in language learning.* *ELT Journal*, 42(4), 272-281. doi: 10.1093/elt/42.4.272
- Vanderplank, R. (1990). *Paying attention to the words: Practical and theoretical problems in watching television programmes with uni-lingual (CEEFAX) sub-titles.* *System*, 18(2), 221-234. doi: 10.1016/0346-251X(90)90056-B
- Vygotsky, L. S. (1980). *Mind in society: The development of higher psychological processes.* Harvard university press.
- Zanon, N. (2006). *Using Subtitles to Enhance Foreign Language Learning.* *Porta Linguarum*, 6 , 41-52.